# MUSIC, COSMOS, AND THE DEVELOPMENT OF PSYCHOLOGY IN EARLY CHINA*

BY

ERICA BRINDLEY
The Pennsylvania State University

> "So it is that when [proper] music is in place then logic is clear, the ears and eyes are perspicacious and acute, blood and material force (*qi*) attain harmony and equilibrium, cultural environments and customs change, and all under heaven is tranquil."
>
> "Yueji" ("Record of Music"), from the Book of Rites[1]

In texts from early China, music often holds a position of paramount importance—whether as a means for rulers to express and wield power, as an integral part of ritual fulfillment and a means by which to achieve efficacy with the spirit world, as a method of personal cultivation, or as a form of entertainment. Of the manifold comments on music present in these texts, one type of claim, embedded in the very term for music itself, becomes quite fundamental in the history of Chinese aesthetics. It is the claim that music (*yue*; Old Chinese: **ngrawk* 樂) is equivalent to joy, or happiness (*le*; OC: **rawk* 樂).[2] As homographs that shared a phonetic root, the Old Chinese

* I would especially like to thank Scott Cook, both for his helpful comments on a draft of this essay and for his insightful dissertation on the musical thought of the Warring States, "Unity and Diversity in the Musical Thought of Warring States China" (Ph.D. diss., University of Michigan, 1995). The works on music of both Cook and Kenneth DeWoskin have aided me tremendously in this project. Special thanks as well to the anonymous reviewers, to David Schaberg, and to Miranda Brown for their extremely helpful comments on previous drafts. I am also grateful to Michael Puett, whose ideas on emotions (*qing*) in the "Xing Zi Ming Chu" have influenced and inspired me very much.

[1] Sun Xidan 孫希旦, ed. *Liji jijie* 禮記集解 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1998), "Yueji 樂記, Part 2," p. 1005.

[2] Xunzi may have been the first thinker to claim explicitly that "music is joy"

terms for music and joy had always been closely linked.[3] This close linguistic association no doubt influenced the way people understood the relationship between music and human emotions throughout early Chinese history. But it was not until around the early third century B.C. that authors began to exaggerate this linguistic connection by asserting the equivalence of the two terms, music and joy. In so doing, they exploited an implicit linguistic connection so as to

---

and to bring renown to such a phrase. See *Xunzi*, Chapter 20. Xiong Gongzhe, trans. and ed., *Xunzi jinzhu jinyi* (Taipei: Shangwu Publishing, 1990), p. 409.

[3] The words for "joy" and "music" in Old Chinese share both the same graph and phonetic root. Each was differentiated from the other on the basis of context, and the pronunciation would differ in accordance to such semantic differentiation, much as one differentiates between *le* and *yue* in modern usage. William H. Baxter, *Handbook of Old Chinese Phonology* (Berlin, Mouton de Gruyter, 1992), p. 534. Etymological ties between the characters for "music" and "joy" had existed long prior to Xunzi's assertion. See also Mizukami Shizuo's discussion of the etymological roots of *yue* in bronze bell inscriptions, where it means "to please," and "to make happy." (Mizukami Shizuo, "'Gaku' ji kō," *Nihon Chūgoku gakkai hō* 18 [1996], p. 28.)

It is important to keep in mind that the term *yue* is not entirely congruent with our own conception of music, and, indeed, that its meanings are not clear-cut or fixed even within the context of Chinese history. *Yue* in classical Chinese generally points to an entire genre of audio-visual performance that centers on music and dancing. Music and dance accoutrements such as instruments, props (costumes, feathers, spears, banners, etc.), and entertainers—as integral components of such performances—are included as part of the fanfare. An even more comprehensive understanding of *yue* as a type of musical entertainment accompanying feasts is apparent in the early Mohists' usage of the term. See *Mozi*, Chapter 32, in Sun Yirang 孫詒讓, ed., *Mozi jiangu* 墨子閒詁 (Taipei: Huaqu shuju, 1987), p. 227. For this reason, scholars might choose to translate the term *yue* as "music and dance performances," or simply, "entertainment." (David Schaberg, private communication.) For more information on the social and political contexts of music, see Wu Hung, "Art and Architecture of the Warring States Period," in Michael Loewe and Edward Shaughnessy, eds., *The Cambridge History of Ancient China* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999), p. 739. See also John Major and Jenny So's introduction, "Music in Late Bronze Age China," in Jenny F. So, ed., *Music in the Age of Confucius* (Washington, D.C.: Freer Gallery of Art and Arthur M. Sackler Gallery, 2000). For the sociopolitical contexts of chime-bells during the Bronze Age, see Lothar von Falkenhausen, *Suspended Music: Chime-Bells in the Culture of Bronze Age China* (Berkeley: University of California, 1993), pp. 23-65.

To my mind, the phrase "music and dance performances" is too unwieldy, while "entertainment" is too broad. By understanding *yue* as entertainment, we fail to distinguish between it and other forms of public or court entertainment such as verbal repartee, archery contests, recitations of poetry, and possibly even executions. Throughout this essay I use the term "music" as a translation for *yue*, despite its lack of a perfect congruence with that concept. I do this not only for the sake of simplicity, but also because the core meaning of *yue* in many of the texts I examine points to sound and the patterning of sound through tunes and harmonies.

highlight and enhance the relationship between music and a primary human emotion.[4]

Why would early Chinese authors be so interested in proclaiming the equivalence of music and the positive emotion of joy? One way to explain such interest is to link it to a new intellectual preoccupation with the human body and psyche that expressed itself during the later Warring States period (ca. 4th-3rd centuries B.C.). Indeed, the literature of this era, unlike that of the Spring and Autumn (770-481 B.C.) and early Warring States (5th century B.C.) periods, is replete with accounts that delineate the many, differentiated aspects of the body and psyche.[5] But what prompted this new interest? My

[4] Many earlier authors allude to implicit associations between the terms, but none proclaims their equivalence, or even links them explicitly. For example, in their extant denouncement of *yue* (Chapter 32), the early Mohists implicitly connect the sounds (*sheng* 聲) of *yue* with the emotion of *yue*-joy/happiness. See Sun Yirang, ed., *Mozi jiangu*, p. 227. Similarly, Mencius speaks in the same phrase of "delighting in music," *le yue* 樂樂 (*Mencius* 1B1), while the authors of the *Zuozhuan* link harmonious music and the joy that is derived from it (*Zuozhuan*, Duke Xiang 11.5). Schaberg demonstrates for the text of the *Mencius* that "The word *yue* is one which Mencius uses along with *le* to describe pleasure of all sorts." See David Schaberg, "Social Pleasures in Early Chinese Historiography and Philosophy," in *The Limits of Historiography*, ed. Christina Kraus (Leiden: Brill, 1999), p. 24. From these examples, it seems clear that the linguistic connection between the two homographs was understood in terms of a semantic connection well before Xunzi's explicit remarks in the 3rd century B.C.

[5] Writings that precede the late fourth century B.C., such as those of the early Mohists and large parts of the *Analects*, possess only a very small vocabulary that might point to the inner workings of humans. Such a vocabulary consists in words that discriminate only vaguely among aspects of the human body and their various functions. The seeming absence in the *Analects* of an extended vocabulary or of detailed discussion of the inner sphere spawned Herbert Fingarette's overstated claims that Confucius's thought and society lacked interest in or awareness of the inner life. As Benjamin Schwartz rebutted in his famous debate with Fingarette, "there is no reason for saying that because something is 'public' it is not an expression of something originating in the person, or that something which is 'inner' may not find expression in the 'outer' without losing its reference to the 'inner.'" See Benjamin Schwartz, *The World of Thought in Ancient China* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1985), p. 87. Indeed, though a consciousness of psychology still awaited formal elaboration, the importance of the individual and his or her inner sphere was clearly present even in early writings from the *Analects*.

The earliest writings that outline a basic psychology not only include the *Mencius* and the "Nei ye," but also a newly excavated text known as the "Xing zi ming chu" ("Nature Emerges from Decree"), which provides possibly the first account yet of a phenomenology of sound in relationship to the emotions and the heart-mind. The "Nei ye" elaborates on the heart-mind and its primary relationship to the Dao of the cosmos, while the *Mencius* discusses such psychological

assertion here, which is indeed supported by the following analysis on music, is that the growth of psychology was largely linked to the emergence of a belief in a new kind of cosmos—one that is highly impersonal and systematic.[6]

---

aspects as human nature, affect and desire, "flood-like *qi*," and "not moving the heart-mind." (See in particular, *Mencius* 2A2; the most important debates on human nature can be found in Chapter 6.) Even the *Laozi*, parts of which had been written down by Mencius's time, contains noteworthy passages that prescribe a bodily attitude or stance that directly involves one's perceptive and intellectual capabilities. See *Laozi*, 52 for the clearest indication of this.

By the 3rd century B.C., discourses on psychology appear much more frequently. Such discourses are also more explicit and detailed than their predecessors of the 4th century B.C. For example, Xunzi outlines the subtle workings of the heart-mind in relation to activity (see *Xunzi*, "Zheng ming," Chapter 22); the *Lüshi chunqiu* presents several views on cognitive and perceptual relationships (this occurs throughout the entire text, and more frequently in Books 1 and 5); and the later chapters of *Zhuangzi* make passing reference to the fundamental state of human nature and its relationship to desires and thought. Then, as the origins of traditional Chinese medicine attest, early Chinese formulations of the body and psyche take off by the middle of the Han Dynasty. All of these types of writings carry on an intellectual discourse revolving around the intricate workings of the mental, affective, and motivational aspects of the body that did not appear to exist in elite writings before the 4th century B.C.

For more information on the development of medical literature during the Han Dynasty, see Tang Lan, "*Huangdi sijing* chutan," *Wenwu* 10 (1974), pp. 48-52; Donald Harper, *Early Chinese Medical Literature: The Mawangdui Medical Manuscripts* (New York: Keegan Paul International, 1998); Nathan Sivin and Geoffrey Lloyd, *The Way and the Word: Science and Medicine in Early China and Greece* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2002); Sarah Queen, "Dong Zhongshu he Huang Lao sixiang," *Daojia wenhua yanjiu* 3 (1993), pp. 256-59; Robin Yates, trans., *Five Lost Classics: Tao, Huang-lao, and Yin-yang in Han China* (New York: Ballantine Books, 1997); and R.P. Peerenboom, *Law and Morality in Ancient China: The Silk Manuscripts of Huang-Lao* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1993).

[6] Of course, there could be many additional reasons for these changes, including the influx of medical knowledge that was once peripheral to the intellectual sphere of the *shi* elite class. This type of hypothesis is put forth by Nathan Sivin, in Sivin and Lloyd, *The Way and the Word*, 25. Also, Warring States writings do not just hint at the birth of an intellectual orientation on cosmological correspondences: the texts bear evidence of what was quite possibly the influx of a new religion or alternative religious orientation (possibly from the Southern and/or coastal regions). Such a religion seems to have been founded on the integral and inherent connections between cosmos and the individual, human body. If true, this religion not only furthered scholarly insights into medicine and medical knowledge, it helped bolster a more unified conception of self in both society and cosmos. For an intriguing account of the coastal religion hypothesis, see Luo Chia-li, "Coastal Culture and Religion in Early China: A Study through Comparison with the Central Plain Region," Ph.D. diss. Indiana University, 1999. For an account that hypothesizes a southwest Asian origin for the *Daodejing*, see Dennis Graflin, "A Southwest Asian Voice in the

In the latter half of the Warring States period, around 350 B.C., intellectuals began making concerted efforts to formulate cosmologies that explained life and the various processes of the world in terms of a broad array of correlations and resonances. This development is part and parcel of what scholars now identify—rather vaguely—as the birth of "correlative cosmology" in early China.[7] Cosmologies that cropped up during this period present the cosmos as a harmonious, impersonal, patterned, and all-encompassing entity. As such, they speak of the human relationship to the divine realm not in terms of arbitrary, personal relationships with deities but in terms of more universal, systematic correspondences among all objects and phenomena of the world.[8] In addition to this development in cosmological outlook, early Chinese intellectuals began to link various elements of human behavior with universal cosmic processes. They did this by delineating the ways in which universal human nature (*xing* 性) holds sway over humans.[9] New interests in psychology reflect these very attempts by

---

*Daodejing*?" *Sino-Platonic Papers*, 79 (March 1998), pp. 1-7; and Victor Mair, *Tao Te Ching: The Classic Book of Integrity and the Way* (New York: Bantam, 1990).

[7] Discourses of the day on the workings of nature display a fundamental belief in the inherent harmony and relationship between certain categories of objects in the world. Most scholars use the term "correlative cosmology" to refer to a very diverse range of discourses on the natural philosophy of the day. Because such a reference fails to describe adequately the underlying view of causation that makes such a cosmology distinctive—namely, that radically different objects obtain mystical resonance with each other—I prefer to use the phrase "cosmology of mystical resonance" instead.

Texts such as the *Mencius*, the *Zhuangzi* "Inner Chapters," and fragments of the *Laozi* appear to contain more references than early Warring States texts to cosmic forces such as *qi* and Yin-yang, and to the various relationships among physical phenomena in the world. However, the foremost thinker to have promoted what scholars now typically epitomize as correlative cosmology was Zou Yan, active around 250 B.C., who successfully promulgated a theory on the "Five Phases." A.C. Graham's work on Yin-yang and correlative cosmologies provides one detailed source in English on this matter. See also Gu Jiegang's *Wude zhongshi shuo xia de zhengzhi he lishi* (Hong Kong: Longmen Publishing, 1970) for a history of Five Phases formulations, as well as the recent essays on the topic of "correlative cosmology" in *Bulletin of the Museum of Far Eastern Antiquities* 72 (2000).

[8] For an in-depth account of the changing religious views from highly agonistic and capricious spirits to naturalistic systems of spirit power, see Michael Puett, *To Become a God: Cosmology, Sacrifice, and Self-divinization in Early China* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Asia Center for the Harvard-Yenching Institute, 2002).

[9] See A.C. Graham, "The Background of the Mencian Theory of Human Nature," in *Tsing Hua Journal of Chinese Studies*, vol. 6 (1957), pp. 215-271.

intellectuals to elaborate on how universal laws and processes of the cosmos help motivate, regulate, and inform human behavior.

Scholars of early China are currently studying the emergence of new branches of knowledge in medicine and psychology from a variety of angles. Michael Puett elaborates on how discussions of human emotions (*qing* 情) became more detailed and defined around this time.[10] Donald Harper and Li Ling adopt a more explicitly physiological and religious approach by addressing how cosmological factors such as material force (*qi* 氣), Yin-yang, and the Five Phases (*wuxing* 五行) implicate the body and its functions.[11] Harper in particular discusses the development of a system of bodily functioning in relation to the cosmos. In addition, scholars such as Nathan Sivin ponder the status of medical knowledge in relation to social institutions and the debates of the *shi* elite class.[12] But while many scholars have researched the history of medicine or philosophy in this period, very few approach the same period and materials from the perspective of psychology.[13]

---

[10] In his work on the semantic developments concerning *qing* from the late Warring States to the early Han, Michael Puett argues for a "gradual refinement of and distinction between various connotations of the term." My claim concerning the growth of debates and ideas on the body (including psychology) during this period agrees with Puett's insights into the changes regarding the term *qing*. See Puett's "The Ethics of Responding Properly: The Notion of *Qing* in Early Chinese Thought," in *Emotions in Chinese Culture*, ed. Halvor Eifring (Leiden: Brill, 2003).

[11] See Donald Harper's work on the technical (*fang* 方) literature of the late Warring States and Early Han periods, which he considers to be a reflection of an outpouring of thought on "natural philosophy and the occult" during this period, in his "Warring States, Qin, and Han Manuscripts related to Natural Philosophy and the Occult," in *New Sources of Early Chinese History: An Introduction to the Reading of Inscriptions and Manuscripts*, ed. Edward Shaughnessy (Berkeley: The Society for the Study of Early China, 1997), pp. 223-252. For Harper's interesting remarks on the role of *mo*-vessel 脈 theory in helping facilitate "the broad application of nature theory to the human organism," see "The Conception of Illness in Early Chinese Medicine, as Documented in Newly Discovered 3rd and 2nd Century B.C. Manuscripts (Part I)," in *Südhoffs Archiv*, 74.2 (1990), pp. 1-31. See also Li Ling 李零, *Zhongguo fangshu kao* 中國方術考 (Beijing: Zhongguo renmin chubanshe, 1993); and Du Zhengsheng 杜正勝, "Xingti, jingqi yu hunpo: Zhongguo chuantong dui 'ren' renshi de xingcheng" 形體、精氣與魂魄, 中國傳統對 '人' 認識的形成: *Xin shixue*, 2.3 (1991), pp. 1-65.

[12] See especially Nathan Sivin, "State, Cosmos, and the Body in the Last Three Centuries B. C.," *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies* 55.1 (1995), pp. 5-37; Wu Kuang-ming, *On Chinese Body Thinking: A Cultural Hermeneutic* (Leiden: Brill, 1997); and Nathan Sivin and Geoffrey Lloyd, *The Way and the Word*.

[13] One explanation for this stems from the belief of many scholars that one

In this essay I analyze discourses on music to demonstrate an emergent interest in a *logos* of the psyche, or "psychology." Through an analysis of certain discourses on music from the 4th to the 2nd century B.C., I show that correspondences among music, cosmos, and the psyche developed during this period according to a triangular relationship. This triangular relationship was expressed in a multitude of ways, but for the most part its expressions can be categorized according to two distinct orientations on the role of music in human psychology. I label these a "psychology of influence" and a "psychology of cosmic attunement." By outlining the basic parameters of these two orientations, I illustrate how music became viewed as a critical means of attaining cosmic balance and harmony, both from within an individual's psyche and in society at large. I also show how the identification of music with the cosmos elevated the status of music so that it might serve as an ideal tool for imperial aspirations for state unity and cosmic control.

Recent scholarship on music in early China certainly stresses its connections to concepts involving the psyche and the cosmos. Kenneth DeWoskin has highlighted the importance of this triad, describing early Chinese discourses on music as seeking to define

---

cannot separate the psyche from the body when discussing early Chinese texts. One therefore cannot speak of a science of psychology separate from that of medicine. While I generally agree with the underlying reasoning behind this view, I disagree with the conclusion that one cannot speak of psychology in its own right. Certainly, one does not have to separate the psyche from the body when discussing psychology. There are many interesting writings in early China that focus primarily on bodily operations that more or less correspond to what we would call the more psychological aspects of the body: the heart-mind (*xin* 心), the intent or aim (*zhi* 志), and the emotions (*qing* 情). Given such an emphasis in the writings themselves, it behooves us to discuss them in terms of such a focus.

Many scholars of the history of medicine fail to notice that our notion of medicine itself is largely informed by a sharp dichotomization between mind and body. By paying exclusive attention to medicine as a *logos* of the body, scholars have unwittingly confined their inquiries to topics that deal with medical intervention in somatic illness. They have not as readily concerned themselves with how such somatic illness might also be understood in terms of the psyche, and they have not given a thorough account of how psychology developed as a critical aspect of medicine.

For a few comments on the early history of psychology in China, see Joseph Needham, *Science and Civilization in China*, vols. 1, 2, and 6 pt. 6 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1954-). Paul Unschuld provides a brief comment on the unity between psychological and somatic illnesses in *Medicine in China: A History of Ideas* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1985), pp. 215-223.

various "cosmos-music-mind correspondences."[14] Similarly, Scott Cook has extensively researched the various textual linkages between cosmos and music, on the one hand, and music and the mind, on the other.[15] However, neither DeWoskin nor Cook draws up a model for change in the triangular relationship among music, cosmos, and psyche.[16] For example, DeWoskin says nothing of the historicity of the cosmos-music-mind triad, and he does not describe music in terms of its relationship to a Warring States development in the science of psychology. His work on music reads as though thinkers of the classical and Han periods were always interested in linking music to the cosmos and the human mind.[17] Cook, focusing on the ways in which musical theory implicated cosmic theory, goes farther than DeWoskin to demonstrate how music and cosmos came to be "one and the same order."[18] Even so, his detailed analyses and close, textual readings do not directly address the issue of an emergent paradigm on cosmic music and psychology. In the present study, I add to DeWoskin's and Cook's insightful accounts on music in early China by showing how changes in the status of music in the cosmos were intimately linked to the development of psychology as well as the needs of the burgeoning imperial state.

In using the term "psyche" rather than "mind," I steer the reader away from thinking of early Chinese views of the body according

---

[14] Kenneth DeWoskin, *A Song for One or Two: Music and the Concept of Art in Early China* (Ann Arbor: Center for Chinese Studies, the University of Michigan, 1982), p. 14.

[15] Cook compares the early Chinese belief in a connection between music and cosmos to the Pythagorean notion of the "Harmony of the Spheres." See Cook, "Unity and Diversity," pp. 86-87, 102-111.

[16] For "psyche," Cook and DeWoskin use the terms "mind," "hearts," "hearts/minds," etc. My use of the term "cosmos" will be defined by the textual contexts under examination. In some texts, the cosmos is conceived in terms of a primary agent, Heaven, which manages and to varying extents controls all the other agents beneath it. In other contexts, Heaven and Earth form a dualistic pair of entities in the world. And in still other contexts, the Dao enters into the picture, usually in relationship to the operations of Heaven.

[17] DeWoskin, *A Song for One or Two*, pp. 14 and 91. This does not mean that DeWoskin believed in the eternal nature of the triad. Indeed, most of his ideas concerning the history of musical thought and aesthetics begin with the Han Dynasty, when the triad was already clearly established. For this reason, there is no need for him to have addressed the notion of its historical development during the Warring States period.

[18] Cook, "Unity and Diversity," p. 103.

to a Cartesian duality between mind and body.[19] I thus invoke the term "psyche" as a hermeneutical tool, which points to a set of general phenomena involving the *xin* (心 "heart-mind"). In addition to referring to the physiological aspects of the *xin*,[20] all references to the "psyche" in this essay include the emotional, motivational, and cognitive forces of the body that help constitute basic, mental activity. Chinese terms of relevance therefore include the emotions (*qing* 情), *qi* (氣 "material forces"), intent (*yi* 意 or *zhi* 志), and human nature (*xing* 性).[21] Also, I use the term "psychology" to point not to the modern discipline and the boundaries of inquiry associated with it, but to a discourse on the psyche found in the early Chinese writings themselves.[22]

Finally, it is important to acknowledge what this essay does not do: it does not purport to outline a complete history of debates on music during the Warring States or early Han periods, nor does it concern itself with the manifold views concerning music and self-cultivation that fall outside of the purview of the general development that it describes. For these reasons, I will not discuss in detail many important passages or treatises on music, such as those stemming from the *Analects*, the early Mohists, the *Zuozhuan*, and the *Huainanzi*. In addition, I will leave for future inquiry the question of the social,

---

[19] For interesting insights into the history of our own understandings of the mind, see Antonio Damasio, *Descartes' Error: Emotion, Reason, and the Human Brain* (New York: Quill, 2000), and Tim Crane and Sarah Patterson, eds., *History of the Mind-Body Problem* (London: Routledge, 2000).

[20] I choose the term "psyche" to represent more than the Cartesian mind. This corresponds with the term's broader etymological meaning in ancient Greek times as breath, life, soul, and spirit. By considering such meanings, we can move beyond the merely intellectual capacities associated with the Cartesian mind. Yet even in Platonic times men distinguished between *psyche* and *soma* (corporeal body). See H.G. Liddell and Scott, *An Intermediate Greek-English Lexicon* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997), p. 903. Thus, my hermeneutical use of the term also does not exactly correspond to ancient Greek usage.

[21] One should note that the emotions are not exclusively associated with *xin* in many of the texts of this period. Therefore, when I refer to such terms as "psyche," or "psychology," I am interested in highlighting a discourse that does not always focus exclusively on *xin*.

[22] I stick with the term "psychology" so as to facilitate work on the history of the psyche, and to view such a history in comparative perspective—in relation to our modern-day field. One must keep in mind that when I speak of psychology in relation to early Chinese discourse, I do not implicate all levels of society. The extent to which the discourses analyzed reached beyond the educated elite classes is not fully known. See Lloyd and Sivin, *The Way and the Word*, pp. 22-27.

political, and ethnic contexts of musical performance, as well as the details concerning the polemics on proper music at the time.

## Music and the Metaphor of Harmony (*He* 和)

Since the Han Dynasty, writings on music in China have been generally divided into two different analytical categories: one concerning its cosmological connections, and the other concerning its moral-psychological connections.[23] Such a division is unfortunate, for it overlooks the primary importance of the triangular relationship among music, cosmos, and psyche that developed over the course of the Warring States period and into the Han.[24] That this was a development that took place in early China and not an inherent ideological stance can be demonstrated by examining how the concept of harmony, a term closely related to musical discourse, changed over the course of the Warring States.[25] In this section I briefly document this change by comparing the meanings of harmony (*he* 和) in some of the earliest available texts from the Zhou period with meanings occurring in texts dating roughly from the late 4th century B.C.[26]

---

[23] Kenneth DeWoskin, *A Song for One or Two*, p. 91.

[24] I am indebted to DeWoskin for insight into this triad. However, I disagree with the sense of timelessness that he seems to associate with the belief in it. See especially pp. 177-183.

[25] For an interesting account of the concept of harmony in relationship to music in early China, see Xiu Hailin 修海林, *Zhongguo gudai yinyue meixue* 中國古代音樂美學 (Fuzhou: Fujian jiaoyu chubanshe, 2004), pp. 105-112. Xiu does not speak of the historicity of the connection between humans and cosmic harmony, but rather presents such a connection as a timeless assumption held by early Chinese thinkers.

[26] The texts I use are as follows: the *Book of Documents*, the *Analects*, the early writings of *Mozi*, and the *Zuozhuan*. Dates for these texts are hotly debated. See Michael Loewe, ed., *Early Chinese Texts: A Bibliographical Guide* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993). For the dating of the *Mozi*, see also A.C. Graham's *Divisions in Early Mohism Reflected in the Core Chapters of Mo-tzu* (Singapore: Institute of East Asian Philosophies, 1985), as well as his *Later Mohist Logic, Ethics and Science* (Hong Kong: The Chinese University Press, 1978). On the dating of the *Zuozhuan*, see the works of Kang Youwei, Henri Maspero, Bernhard Karlgren, and William Hung, who have all written substantially on this topic. More recently, David Schaberg writes about the *Zuozhuan* in the context of fourth century B.C. Confucian traditions of thought. See David Schaberg, "Appendix: Orality and the Origins of the *Zuozhuan* and *Guoyu*," in *A Patterned Past: Form and Thought in Early Chinese Historiography* (Cambridge: Harvard University Asia Center, 2001), pp. 315-324. See also Yuri Pines, "Intellectual Change in the Chunqiu Period: The Reliability of the Speeches in the *Zuo zhuan* as Sources of Chunqiu Intellectual History," *Early China* 22 (1997), pp. 77-132.

This comparison will establish a basis for my claim that musical psychology developed in conjunction with the growing belief in an inherently harmonious cosmic system, and that such changes occurred towards the latter half of the Warring States period.

Music possesses a special relationship to the concept of harmony from quite early in the textual record. In many of the pre-Warring States chapters of the *Book of Documents* (*Shangshu*), the term can be found in a variety of contexts and in relationship to music as well as social interactions.[27] In the latter case, harmony conveys that which humans might achieve in, among, and for groups of people, whether in one's speech, at a gathering of leaders, or for the larger population (over which one, presumably, rules).[28] In all of these instances, harmony indicates a human accomplishment. It is that which humans strive to construct so that benefit will result in the realms of music, society, and politics.[29]

In the *Analects* as well, harmony appears not only as a key characteristic of proper music, but as a standard of both musical performance and human interaction: "When the Master was singing with other people and liked someone else's song, he always asked for him to repeat it before harmonizing along with him" 子與人歌而善必使反之而後和之.[30] Here, harmonizing implies both one's participation in music and the patterning of such participation through human compliance with, not disruption of, the situation.[31] As a key to patterned social integration, harmony represents a social ideal. But it also represents a political goal: "Where there is harmony there is

[27] See Edward Shaughnessy's dating of the text's various chapters, in Michael Loewe, *Early Chinese Texts*, pp. 377-380.

[28] *Shangshu* (*Book of Documents*). The usages referred to here occur in the pre-Warring States chapters of "Shun Dian," "Luo Gao," "Wu Yi," "Jun Shi," "Duo Fang," "Li Zheng," and "Gu Ming." Shaughnessy asserts that most of these chapters constitute the "heart of the authentic *Shangshu*." Ibid., p. 379.

[29] This does not mean that the term was not primarily used in aesthetic contexts. Noting the special application of "harmony" to non-musical or non-aesthetic contexts, Scott Cook argues for a primarily aesthetic sense of the notion: "No early Chinese text ever sets out to demonstrate the aesthetic necessity of the harmonious balance of contrasting parameters in music or cuisine by an appeal to the intrinsic nature of social and governmental operation." Cook, "Unity and Diversity," p. 72.

[30] *Analects*, 7.32. Adapted from the translation by D.C. Lau, *Confucius: The Analects* (London: Penguin, 1979), p. 90.

[31] See also *Analects* 1.12 and 13.23 for more instances of harmony as a social ideal.

no such thing as having a low population" 和無寡.[32] As a standard of social interaction, harmony could extend beyond the realm of music to the realm of society at large. This sociopolitical use of the term can be found in early Mohist writings. Specifically, the early Mohists refer to the goal of achieving a state of "harmony of the world" 天下之和, as well as of "harmony of the myriad people" 萬民和.[33] Thus, in both the *Analects* and early Mohist writings, harmony is not inherent to music or society itself, but achieved through humans in each realm.

The *Zuozhuan* also generally confirms a view of harmony as a human achievement of the aesthetic, social, and political realms.[34] For example, Yanzi invokes the harmony a chef might achieve through cooking in explaining how harmonious human behavior differs from conformism:

> 和如羹焉水火醯醢鹽梅以烹魚肉燀之以薪宰夫和之齊之以味濟其不及以洩其過君子食之以平其心
> Harmony is like a broth. Water, fire, vinegar, meat juices, salt, and plum are used to boil fish meat. It is cooked with firewood, and the chef harmonizes and equalizes it to taste. He adds to what is lacking and dilutes what is in excess. The gentleman drinks it to even out his heart-mind.[35]

Significantly, harmony in this passage is not inherent in any of the objects in which it obtains, such as the broth or the gentleman. It is acquired and constructed through human effort.[36] In another

---

[32] *Analects* 16.1. Confucius, *Lunyu yizhu* 論語譯註, ed. Yang Bojun 楊伯峻 (Hong Kong: Zhonghua shuju, 1984), p. 172.

[33] Sun Yirang, ed., *Mozi jiangu*, 10 ("Elevating the Worthy, *Xia*" 尚賢下), 19 ("Against Aggressive Warfare, *Xia*" 非攻下), and 27 ("Heaven's Will, *Zhong*" 天志中).

[34] The term *he* occurs too many times in this text to analyze it here in the detail it deserves. My statements thus only constitute a general claim about its usage there. Also, given the text's relatively late date (ca. 4th century B.C.), it is likely that the transformations I outline were already beginning to take place in a limited fashion. Therefore, even if there exist a few textual citations in which harmony is applied to the cosmos, my theory could still stand.

[35] Yang Bojun, annot., *Chunqiu Zuozhuan zhu* 春秋左傳注 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1995), "Duke Zhao 20.8," p. 1419.

[36] See *Zuozhuan*, "Duke Xi 24.2," "Duke Xiang 11.10," and "Duke Xiang 29.8," among other passages. While some of the references using the term *he* in the *Zuozhuan* point to aesthetic contexts of music and the harmony of the "five sounds" (*wusheng* 五聲) like the one just quoted, most examples refer to the "harmony of the people/masses" (*he min/zhong* 和民眾) as a social ideal. See for example *Zuozhuan*, "Duke Yin 4.4," "Duke Xi 5.9," and "Duke Xuan 12.3."

chapter of the *Zuozhuan* as well, the use of the term "harmony" in relationship to music most exclusively points to a quality achieved and expressed through the dances and airs of specific states.[37]

In relatively early Warring States texts, the term "harmony" primarily expresses aesthetic ideals, interpersonal and political achievement, and even goals for an integrated social order. When not referring to aesthetic ideals in the context of the culinary and musical arts, the term almost without exception refers to the goals of rulers in governing their people as well as the signs of political and social order and stability. In this sense, it belongs to the realms of artifice, achievement, and political attainment pursued by humans.[38]

At some point by the late 4th and early 3rd centuries B.C., many authors began to formulate a more naturalistic concept of harmony, one that implied the intrinsic balance of cosmic forces in the world, in people, and in things. Harmony referred no longer merely to that which individuals can achieve through music, ritual, their behavior, or good rule. It was no longer exclusively a goal of human attainment; it was a fundamental characteristic, pattern, and even structure of the cosmos as well.[39] We see this new usage in texts that can be dated more squarely within a period starting from around 325 B.C.

One of the most famous and possibly earliest examples in which the term harmony refers to the inherent workings of the cosmos occurs in Zhuangzi's passage on the panpipes of man, Earth, and Heaven.[40] In this passage, just as the breath of humans creates music through certain instruments, the wind of the earth creates a chorus or harmony of natural sounds, and the piping of Heaven produces

---

[37] *Zuozhuan*, "Duke Xiang, 29.13-19." Indeed, it was not uncommon for expert musicians to associate certain sounds, harmonies, or airs with prognostications about human affairs. See "Duke Xiang 18.4" for Master Shi Kuang's comments on the "complacent airs" and "dead sounds" from the state of Chu. Even in such a context, however, music is not explicitly connected to cosmos, and the harmonies produced by such music might be interpreted merely as shoddy human constructions that have negative social but not cosmic implications.

[38] For an account of actual debates over nature and artifice during the Warring States period, see Michael Puett, *The Ambivalence of Creation: Debates Concerning Innovation and Artifice in Early China* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2001).

[39] Even though this development occurs, this is not to say that the other uses of harmony cease to exist as such. What I describe is an additional overlay of meaning that gradually begins to dominate the semantic range of the term.

[40] Zhuangzi, annot. Guo Qingfan 郭慶藩, *Zhuangzi jishi* 莊子集釋 (Taipei: Wanjuan lou, 1993), 2 ("Qiwu Lun" 齊物論), pp. 43-114.

a diverse harmony of self-motivated life forces among the myriad creatures. The depiction of music as the way of the cosmos is so deeply embedded in this passage that I believe it makes much sense to interpret the comparison literally rather than figuratively: in other words, in terms of the workings of cosmos as a form of music, and not merely as processes similar to music. In this interpretation, one that compares favorably with Pythagoras's notion of the "Music of the Spheres," Heavenly music is a performance produced or given by the various processes of life and nature, or, more simply, the cosmos.[41]

The *Lüshi chunqiu*, datable to around 239 B.C., picks up on this theme of the inherent harmonies and sounds of the cosmos to draw important conclusions about the music of humans. Rather than focus on a claim that the cosmos is music, the authors of the *Lüshi chunqiu* chapter, "Great Music," acknowledge the cosmic roots of sound. They do this in order to point out that the principles and building blocks of sagely music actually replicate cosmic harmonies: "When the youngest sprouts were first stimulated, they were given shape through coagulation. Shapes and forms had their hollow places, and none was without sound. Sound emerged from harmony, harmony from what is fitting. When the First Kings fixed their music, they started from these principles" 萌芽始震凝寒以形形體有虛莫不有聲聲出於和和出於適先王定樂由此而生.[42] Here, as with Zhuangzi, harmony

[41] A similar passage in the *Laozi* points to a more metaphorical interpretation of the cosmos as music. Wang Bi's reading of *Laozi* 5 reads, "The space between Heaven and Earth is it not just like a bellows or a mouth organ!" Wang Bi, *The Classic of the Way and Virtue: A New Translation of the* Tao-te ching *of Laozi as Interpreted by Wang Bi*, trans. Richard Lynn (New York: Columbia University Press, 1999), p. 60, and footnote 3 (pp. 61-62). Here, the cosmos is likened to the space in a mouth organ that serves as the locus for the instrument's production of sound.

For the notion, arising from Pythagoras's (sixth century B.C.) "music of the spheres," that the movement of the planets produces music, see Jamie James, *The Music of the Spheres: Music, Science, and the Natural Order of the Universe* (New York: Copernicus Books, 1995). It is not known whether the early Chinese, in believing that the movements of the cosmos produce music, were influenced by Pythagoras's theories on the connections between numerical patterns and music. It might have been the case, as Scott Cook suggests, that an early Chinese awareness of musical harmony and its conformity to the numerical laws of the cosmos arose entirely within the Chinese tradition itself, so that the "very cosmic order would be explained in terms of musical qualities." Cook, "Unity and Diversity," p. 103. But the possibility that the Greeks somehow influenced the Chinese on this matter, or vice versa, cannot be ruled out.

[42] Lü Buwei 呂不韋, comp., annot. Chen Qiyou 陳奇猷, *Lüshi Chunqiu jiaoshi*

is key to the ontology of the cosmos. The musical principles of the cosmos derive from the hollows of the world, underlying its very existence and operation.[43]

Other passages from the same chapter of *Lüshi chunqiu* lend credence to this conclusion: "As a general principle, music is the harmony between Heaven and Earth, and the perfect blend of Yin and Yang" 凡樂天地之和陰陽之調也.[44] Still later, the author hints that human music should imitate natural sounds. This resonates with a belief that harmony, in this context most certainly pointing to a sort of music, is inherent in the cosmos: "Kui thereupon made songs in imitation of the sounds of the forests and valleys, he covered earthenware tubs with fresh hides and beat on them, and he slapped stones and hit rocks to imitate the sounds of the jade stone chimes of the Supreme Sovereign, with which he made the hundred wild beasts dance" 夔乃校山林谿谷之音以歌乃以麋置缶而鼓之乃拊石擊石以象上帝玉磬之音以致舞百獸.[45] Kui, commanded by the sage Emperor Yao, creates music that imitates natural sounds. His human creation, while producing a harmony entirely of its own, nonetheless appears as an extension of cosmic sounds. Though this passage does not directly state that harmony is inherent in the cosmos, there is an underlying sense that the cosmos (as represented through nature) constitutes an inherently musical space.

A section of the *Mozi* that is quite probably a later, post-fourth-century B.C. creation also points to a harmonious cosmos that serves as an ideal for social order.[46] The author of Chapter 6, "Ci Guo," speaks of the inherent "harmony of Yin and Yang" 陰陽之和 as well as the human goals of re-establishing "harmony between Heaven and Earth" 天地和 and "harmony of one's body (flesh and skin)" 肌

---

呂氏春秋校釋 5.2 ("Da Yue 大樂"), p. 255. Translation adapted from Lü Buwei, *The Annals of Lü Buwei (Lüshi chunqiu): A Complete Translation and Study*, trans. and ed. John Knoblock and Jeffrey Riegel (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2000), pp. 136-7.

[43] On how music relates to the wind, see Cai Zhongde 蔡仲德, *Zhongguo yinyue meixue shi* 中國音樂美學史 (Taipei: Landeng, 1993).

[44] Lü Buwei, *Lüshi chunqiu jiaoshi* 5.2 ("Da Yue 大樂"), p. 256. Translation by Knoblock and Riegel, p. 138.

[45] Ibid., 5.5 ("Gu Yue 古樂"), p. 285. Knoblock and Riegel, p. 149.

[46] For discussions of the dating of the various chapters of Mohist writings, see A.C. Graham, *Divisions in Early Mohism*, and Michael Loewe, *Early Chinese Texts*, pp. 336-341.

膚和 through sagely control of the desires.[47] Similarly, the notion that cosmic harmony can be established through the workings of Yin and Yang is also present in the *Laozi*, which was probably compiled no earlier than the late 4th century B.C.[48] In Chapter 42 of that text, the author shows how the myriad things blend or shake the energy (*qi*) of Yin and Yang to create a harmonious admixture of cosmic elements.[49] While this vision conceives of the myriad things as agents who aid in the creation of cosmic harmony, such agents can only achieve harmony by allowing the processes of the cosmos (those inherent in themselves as well) to occur spontaneously.[50]

Even the "Yueji," the foremost classical treatise on music in the Confucian tradition found in the *Book of Rites*, espouses a view of harmony as intrinsic to the cosmos:

> 地氣上齊天氣下降陰陽相摩天地相蕩鼓之以雷霆奮之以風雨動之以四時煖之以日月而百化興焉如此則樂者天地之和也
> The *qi* of Earth ascends evenly [to Heaven], while that of Heaven descends to Earth. Yin and Yang rub against each other; Heaven and Earth ruffle each other. They drum it so as to [produce] peals of thunder, arouse it to [produce] wind and rain, move it to [produce] the four seasons, warm it to [produce] the sun and moon, and the hundred transformations arise. It is in this manner that music constitutes the harmony of Heaven and Earth.[51]

This author implicates the natural harmony of sexual relations, as represented by a masculine Heaven and feminine Earth, in a musical

---

[47] *Mozi jiangu*, 6 ("Ci Guo 辭過"), pp. 34-5.

[48] Much debate concerning the textual history of *Laozi* has been spawned by the discovery of Laozian fragments in the Guodian tomb, datable to ca. 300 B.C. See *Guodian Chumu zhujian* 郭店楚墓竹簡 (*GDCMZJ*), ed. Cai Min 蔡敏 and others (Jingmen: Wenwu, 1998). What these debates suggest is that, while it seems likely that oral traditions espousing Laozian types of thought were in existence during the late 4th century B.C., the compilation of the text "in 5,000 characters" transmitted throughout the centuries, as well as the prevalence and impact of these notions on contemporary intellectual currents, is likely not to have occurred before the third century B.C. See Harold Roth "Some Methodological Issues in the Study of the Guodian *Laozi* Parallels," in *The Guodian Laozi: Proceedings of the International Conference, Dartmouth College, May 1998*, ed. Sarah Allan and Crispin Williams (Berkeley: Society for the Study of Early China and the Institute of East Asian Studies, University of California, 2000), pp. 71-88.

[49] *Laozi*, Chapter 42.

[50] For an in-depth discussion of the concept of *wuwei* as a metaphor for early Chinese thought, see Edward Slingerland, *Effortless Action: Wu-Wei as Conceptual Metaphor and Spiritual Ideal in Early China* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003).

[51] The "it" in question most likely refers back to *qi*. *Liji jijie*, "Yueji" 樂記, Part I, p. 993.

dance that inheres in cosmic processes. Thus, like Zhuangzi, he goes so far as to claim that the forces and interactions of the cosmos constitute music at its very core.

In the Confucian text, *Zhongyong*, approximately datable to the 3rd or 2nd century B.C.,[52] harmony is connected to the metaphysical underpinnings of the cosmos. It represents a vital accomplishment in cosmic operations, and not merely an attainment of humans, as in the texts described above:

> 喜怒哀樂之未發謂之中發而皆中節謂之和中也者天下之大本也和也者天下之達道也致中和天地位焉萬物育焉
> When happiness, anger, grief, joy have not yet issued forth, we call it being centered. When they have issued forth yet each attain due measure, we call it being in harmony. Centrality is the great root of the world; harmony is the world arriving at the Way. Centrality and harmony achieved, Heaven and Earth [find their correct] positions, and the myriad creatures are nourished.[53]

Here, all life, creation, and even the operations of the cosmos depend on centrality and harmony. Harmony is the attainment of the Way that helps place cosmic operations back in order. Though, unlike in the other passages just examined, harmony does not describe the inherent functions of the cosmos, it does describe its idealized and proper state of being. This passage thus shares with the other, post-4th century B.C. texts an orientation towards harmony as something idealized and applicable to the entire cosmos, not merely the sociopolitical order.

As these later texts attest, by the time of the late Warring States or early Han harmony was a term of cosmic significance.[54] The meaning of the term was broadened so as to point to the realm of the cosmos rather than merely that of aesthetics and society.[55] The

---

[52] For the dating of this text, see Michael Loewe, ed., *Early Chinese Texts*.

[53] Xie Bingying 謝冰瑩 et al., eds., *Xinyi sishu duben* 新譯四書讀本, *Zhongyong xinyi* 中庸新譯 (Taipei: Sanmin shuju, 1991), p. 22.

[54] This perspective provides a lasting backdrop to discourses concerning music throughout the Han Dynasty. DeWoskin cites at least two passages from Han apocrypha which assume that music underlies the operations of the cosmos. See DeWoskin, *A Song for One or Two*, p. 166 and footnote 22.

[55] Cook does not describe this change in terms specific to Chinese history, but he does suggest that such a view arose in direct relationship to the attainment of knowledge about relations between musical harmonies and numerical perfections, as also expressed in the natural world. Implicitly, Cook explains the association of music and the cosmos to the growth of an explicit knowledge in musical harmonies. Cook, "Unity and Diversity," pp. 103-105.

effects of this transformation were more than just linguistic or limited to the realm of metaphor; they were also ontological in nature.[56] In such a case harmony does not just describe the cosmos figuratively; it serves as the very basis for its operations and existence, whether such an existence is normative or not. As we will see below, this ontology of a harmonious cosmos is precisely what informed intellectuals as they began to discuss the role of music in human psychology.

As authors began to extend the discursive reach of harmony to the cosmic realm, they conferred on music a new role as a vehicle for attaining such order. At the same time, they also became increasingly aware of cosmic connections to the human psyche, and began to establish a special triangular relationship among music, cosmos, and psyche. I explore just such a triangular relationship below as it developed and was expressed in a handful of texts from the 4th to 2nd centuries B.C. While a large portion of these texts promote a strictly Confucian program of self-cultivation and ritual mastery, many of those from the 3rd and 2nd century cannot be exclusively linked to any single intellectual lineage of the day.[57] In this sense it can be said that the developments to which I refer were not strictly limited to Confucian lineages of thought.

---

[56] For interesting contemporary theories on how metaphors help constitute the operations of the brain, see George Lakoff and Mark Johnson, *Philosophy in the Flesh: The Embodied Mind and its Challenge to Western Thought* (New York: Basic Books, 1999); Mark Johnson, *The Body in the Mind: The Bodily Basis of Meaning, Imagination, and Reason* (Chicago: University of Chicago, 1987); and Gilles Fauconnier and Mark Turner, *The Way We Think: Conceptual Blending and the Mind's Hidden Complexities* (New York: Basic Books, 2002).

[57] By "lineages," I mean the self-conscious affiliations between teacher and disciple that developed in an extremely messy manner during the Warring States. On this topic, see Kidder Smith, "Sima Tan and the Invention of Daoism, 'Legalism,' Et Cetera," *Journal of Asian Studies*, 63.1 (2003), pp. 129-156; and Mark Csikszentmihalyi and Michael Nylan, "Constructing Lineages and Inventing Traditions through Exemplary Figures in Early China," *T'oung Pao*, vol. 89, fasc. 1-3 (2003), pp. 59-99. See also Jens Østergård Petersen, "Which Books Did the First Emperor of Ch'in Burn? On the Meaning of *Pai Chia* in Early Chinese Sources," *Monumenta Serica* 43 (1995), pp. 1-52.

## A Psychology of Influence

*Music and Self-Cultivation in the "Xing zi ming chu"*

Psychologies that developed in certain Confucian texts of the 4th and 3rd centuries B.C. provide a cogent rationale for the belief that music has a moral effect on humans. A text—most likely of a Confucian lineage and given the modern label, "Xing zi ming chu" 性自命出 ("Nature Emerges from Decree," hereafter *XZMC*)—offers one of the earliest phenomenological accounts of how one's emotions (*qing* 情) relate to human nature (*xing* 性) and external stimuli such as sound and music.[58] Its particular theories on the human psyche are

[58] The *XZMC* was discovered in 1993 at Guodian and made available to international audiences in 1998. It appears either to predate or to be contemporaneous with the *Mencius*, and derives from a lineage that clearly propounded Ru-ist (儒), or Confucian, ideals. This is because, though they were discovered among some early versions of the *Laozi*, the bulk of the texts found at Guodian profess a Confucian agenda by focusing their attention rather exclusively on the importance of Zhou traditions and gentlemanly moral self-cultivation. In particular, the *XZMC* not only provides justification for and explanation of the effects of music and ritual on moral self-cultivation, it also mentions the ancient sages in relationship to their creation of the *Odes*, *Documents*, rites, and music—traditions which were later to form the bulwark of the Confucian Canon. It is important to bear in mind that the reference to the *Odes* and *Documents* in the *XZMC* does not necessarily prove that these were already written down and canonized at the time. It is possible that the author was simply referring to a specific set of oral sayings and traditions that go by such a name.

Though the text does not have any extant, transmitted counterpart, what appears to be another version of it has been found among the ancient bamboo strips purchased recently by the Shanghai Museum: see Ma Chengyuan 馬承源, ed., *Shanghai bowuguan cang Zhanguo Chu zhushu* 上海博物館藏戰國楚竹書 (hereafter *SZCZS*), vol. 1 (Shanghai: Shanghai Guji Publishing Co., 2001). This other version, called "Xingqing lun" 性情論 ("Discourse on Human Nature and the Emotions," hereafter *XQL*), is much the same as the *XZMC* in its words and textual order, though it deviates slightly in terms of the graphical forms and expressions it uses. A few sentence chains are unique to both the *XQL* and *XZMC*. Though such differences could in some cases point to the existence of missing strips in both versions, some of the divergent sentence chains occur in the middle of a section that is otherwise completely the same in both versions, and, significantly, they occur where there is no evidence of textual rupture.

The *SZCZS* also provides a slightly different textual arrangement than that given by the compilers of the Guodian strips. This divergence in textual arrangement may represent the mistakes of the original compilers and editors of the Guodian strips, who faced enormous challenges in their initial ordering of the strips. Or it may simply attest to the way in which texts were compiled and transmitted in the Warring States—an era before the production of fixed texts and canons.

coherent and compelling, and they give us a different perspective on how to understand the development of psychology during its earlier stages around the 4th century B.C. In particular, such theories take part in what I label a "psychology of influence," or, a psychology that outlines the specific ways in which external phenomena such as sound and music shape one's self and being. Below, I analyze the text's deep interplay between music, the heart-mind, and certain aspects of one's Heaven-endowed (cosmic) nature—the emotions.[59]

One of the most striking aspects of the *XZMC* is its commentary on human nature. The author's views on human nature are intimately tied to his conception of the workings of the psyche, for they provide a basis for understanding the extent to which an individual's own faculties exert agency over his environment. Understanding his conception of human nature will allow us to grasp his comments on how sound and music might deeply influence the psyche.

Unlike Mencius, the author of *XZMC* attributes great power to external things and forces in shaping, and ultimately giving direction to our unfixed wills (*zhi* 志) and natural endowments: "Although all humans possess human nature, the heart-mind does not possess a

---

Apart from these few differences, the two texts are so similar that the editors of *SZCZS* felt justified in filling in entire swaths of text that were missing from the *XQL* with what they believed were the same parts from the *XZMC*. Indeed, it appears that missing portions of the *XZMC* can be replaced with text from *XQL* with a high degree of confidence. For example, the phrase, "The sounds of bronze and stone...(five missing blanks)" 金石之有聲 in *XZMC* can be supplemented with text from the same section in *XQL* to read, "As for the sounds of bronze and stone, [they] will not ring if not struck" 金石之有聲也弗扣不鳴. Ma Chengyuan, *SZCZS*, p. 225. Such interchangeability strongly suggests that we really are talking about the same text, and that we should regard these writings as two versions of it, just as we refer to the Mawangdui, Heshanggong, or Guodian versions of the *Laozi*. For an interesting account of the implications of such textual similarity, see Martin Kern, "The Odes in Excavated Manuscripts," in *Text and Ritual in Early China* (Seattle: University of Washington Press, 2005), p. 157. Kern claims that such similarities among texts, especially those without transmitted counterparts, suggest a remarkable stability in transmission.

[59] Michael Puett's interpretations of this text have been very influential and helpful in my analysis of the issues at hand. I benefited very much from the summer workshop on Guodian texts that he arranged at Harvard University (1998). For an in-depth account of emotions as presented in the text, see Puett's "The Notion of Qing." Many thanks as well to P.J. Ivanhoe for his helpful comments on a draft of this section. I have also benefited from reading and considering translations or partial translations of this text by Paul Goldin and Sarah Queen (unpublished work). See Paul Goldin, "Xunzi in the Light of the Guodian Manuscripts," *Early China* 25 (2000), pp. 113-146.

fixed (regulated) will" 凡人雖有性心亡定（正）志.[60] This provocative first sentence concedes to a shared, universal nature among humans, but it immediately qualifies the power of such a nature to determine the courses of our lives. Such a quick qualification of human nature shares an affinity with the only direct claim concerning human nature provided in the *Analects*; namely, that we are all similar in nature but different through practice (*xi* 習).[61] The fact that the *XZMC* explains human difference not immediately in terms of practice, as in the *Analects*, but in terms of the fundamental indeterminacy of the heart-mind and its related function, the will (*zhi* 志), suggests that the *XZMC* is much more psychological in its orientation. Indeed, in that text, unlike anywhere in the *Analects* or even any extant, reputedly pre-Mencian text besides the "Nei ye," we find an intricate discussion of the workings of the psyche and its relationships to the external world—in particular, to music.[62]

In the opening statements of the text, the author shows that the direction of our wills is contingent upon "external things," "pleasures," and "practices." Moreover, the natural emotions 情 (which "stem from human nature") are not expressed without "external things grabbing hold of them" 物取之.[63] Certainly, this author paints a very

---

[60] *XZMC*, Cai Min, *GDCMZJ*, strip 1, p. 179. The same line from *XQL* uses the word "regulated" (*zheng* 正) instead of "fixed" (*ding* 定). Ma Chengyuan, *SZCZS*, pp. 220-221. The same graph in *XZMC* can also be transcribed as *zheng*. Since either graph could be a lexical variant for the other, I have chosen to take it as "fixed" on the consideration that this term best underscores the author's problematic of using the heart-mind to make the correct decisions out of an array of possible ones. In translating from this text, I use the current Chinese transcriptions provided by the editorial teams of both the Guodian and Shanghai Museum strips. My interpretations are thus completely based on the foundational work of these editors, not on my own paleographical reading of certain graphs in their pure, untranscribed state.

[61] *Analects*, 17.2.

[62] If the "Nei ye" is indeed a 4th-century B.C. text, as such scholars as Luo Genze, Guo Moruo, A.C. Graham, Harold Roth, and W. Allyn Rickett suggest it is, then it is perhaps the only text besides the *XZMC* and the *Mencius* to enter at length into discussions of the human psyche. Even then, the "Nei ye" does not really focus on interrelationships between the external and internal realms as does the *XZMC*. See Allyn Rickett, *Guanzi: Political, Economic, and Philosophical Essays from Early China*, vol. 2 (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1998), pp. 15-39; and Harold Roth, *Original Tao: Inward Training and the Foundations of Taoist Mysticism* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1999), p. 26.

[63] Some scholars point out that the graph for *qu* 取 might actually refer to the lexical meaning of its cognate, *ju* 聚 ("to gather together," "concentrate"). This would change the meaning of the text considerably, lending it a more internal focus

passive picture of human nature, one that suggests a blank slate.[64] However, while he stresses the significance of the environment, he also takes pains to acknowledge and address the basic characteristics of human nature as well as the particular ways the environment may interact with and draw out these aspects. This suggests not a blank slate but an apparatus that is endowed with fixed characteristics that regulate how the environment may act with and upon it.

Not just any external agent may act upon human nature and produce the same responses. The following passage shows how certain types of external agents interact with human nature, suggesting the existence of fixed, albeit passive characteristics of human nature:

> 凡動性者物也逢性者悅也交性者故也厲性者義也出性者勢也養性者習也長性者道也
> In general, what moves human nature are things; what greets it is pleasure; what intersects with it are causes; what sharpens it is rightness; what cause its expression are circumstances; what nourishes it is practice; and what extends it is the Dao.[65]

Because there is order and regularity in how each force or agent produces a certain response in human nature, one cannot simply refer to human nature as a blank slate. Rather, human nature is an entity with fixed but changeable characteristics, and, as various external forces such as the Dao act upon it, it can grow and alter itself within the parameters set for those characteristics.

---

that clearly maintains the integrity and power of the human psyche in itself. See Ma Chengyuan, *SZCZS*, p. 222; Li Ling 李零, *Guodian Chujian jiaodu ji* 郭店楚簡校讀記 (Beijing: Beijing daxue, 2002), p. 112; and Chen Wei 陳偉, *Guodian zhushu bieshi* 郭店竹書別釋 (Wuhan: Hubei jiaoyu, 2003), pp. 182-83. I stand by my reading of *qu* as "to grab, to take," because such a meaning better accentuates the external nature of teachings and their powers over the self. Many thanks to Donald Harper for pointing out this lexical and philosophical possibility.

[64] For a trenchant critique and description of currently prevailing blank slate theories, see Steven Pinker, *The Blank Slate: The Modern Denial of Human nature* (New York: Viking, 2002).

[65] *XZMC*, Cai Min, *GDCMZJ*, strips 12-18, p. 179. The term translated as "to intersect" (*jiao* 交) is represented by a graphic element that can also refer to the lexical meaning, "to arrive, to reach" (*zhi* 至) or "to realize, to actualize" (*shi* 實). Thanks to Kenneth Huang for pointing out these graphical variants. Also, the term translated as "to greet" (*feng* 逢) is transcribed by the editors of *SZCZS* as "to go against, counter, defy" (*ni* 逆). I have not been able to understand how this lexically plausible transcription makes sense in the light of the context, in particular, the statement's direct object, "pleasure" (*yue* 悅). Ma Chengyuan, *SZCZS*, p. 227.

*The Mechanics of Sound Transmission*

Due to its potential for defined change, human nature can be guided according to what the author refers to as the human Dao (*rendao* 人道). This Dao is not merely a goal of attainment; it is a path and medium that guides our personal endowments toward attainment. Thinking of the Dao in this way, the author underscores the natural connections of the Dao to the human emotions. This is clear in the following statements on the psychological roots of moral cultivation:

> 性自命出命自天降道始於情情生於性始者近情終者近義
> Human nature emerges from Decree; Decree is sent down from Heaven. The Dao begins with emotions; emotions are born of human nature. He who is beginning (on the Dao) is near to the emotions; he who is ending (on the Dao) is near to rightness.[66]

This passage establishes an undeniable connection between the Dao and the emotions, which stem from human nature and, ultimately, Heaven. According to this translation, the Dao is not a natural product of the emotions, and it does not appear to be an innate part of the human endowment, or human nature. It is the path whereby one moves from a state in which human nature and the emotions manifest themselves according to their original characteristics to a state in which they manifest themselves according to the tenets of rightness. In other words, the Dao transforms the raw endowments of a person into a developed capacity for moral judgment and behavior.

The author's phrasing of the progress of the Dao from the emotions (i.e. that which is endowed in human nature) to rightness is critical. It shows that the process of the Dao is continuous—that there is a seamless line between human nature and rightness. This suggests wholesome, organic change that does not violate human nature, as Mencius would say.[67] The text confirms that the emotions are connected to the Dao in a seamless fashion by intimating that compliance with the Dao consists not in ridding oneself of emotions, but in expressing them properly: "If you [act] by using emotions, then though you transgress, there is no dislike. If you do not [act] by using emotions, then though something is difficult, it will not be

---

[66] *XZMC*, Cai Min, *GDCMZJ*, strips 2-3, p. 179.

[67] *Mencius*, 6A1. *Mengzi yizhu*, Yang Bojun, ed. and trans. (Hong Kong: Zhonghua shuju, 1998), p. 253.

valued. If you possess your emotions, then even though you have not yet acted, the people present will believe you." 苟以其情雖過不惡不以其情雖難不貴苟有其情雖未之爲斯人信之矣.[68] Clearly, the author does not intend for the emotions to disappear or lose their fundamental characteristics when one complies with the Dao. The Dao thus does not seem to alter one's human nature radically; it works to extend and enhance what already exists within. As it guides human nature in the proper, moral direction, it accepts what is already there, changing it with each progressive step.

For the author of *XZMC*, the "human Dao" (*rendao*) is the most important means to self-cultivation. This particular Dao functions through teachings (*jiao* 教), of which music plays an integral part. In order to understand the special position of music as part of the normative Dao over humans, it is important to realize that the term "Dao" sometimes refers in the text to many different paths, all of which might exert some kind of deterministic force over human nature and behavior. This can be seen in the fact that *jiao* 教 ("teachings") in the *XZMC* possesses two basic meanings, namely, (1) the specific teachings of the sages (including music), and (2) any determining force in one's environment which gives rise to adaptive learning (including sounds). According to the latter, more general usage, "teachings" can be taken as "environmental influence," or even, "upbringing." The following statements make this clear:

> 而學或使之也凡物亡不異也者剛之柆剛取之也柔之約柔取之也四海之內其性一也其用心各異教使然也
> ...yet learning (*xue* 學) is that which drives it. Of the many things [of the world], there is none that is not different. A bowl has the quality of being hard because hardness grabs hold of it. A rope has the quality of being soft because softness grabs hold of it.[69] Within the four seas, nature is the same. That each uses its heart-mind differently is because upbringing makes it so.[70]

This last statement suggests that *jiao*, in its broadest sense, encompasses the various influences and even qualities of the external

---

[68] *XZMC*, Cai Min, *GDCMZJ*, strips 50-51, p. 181. The *SZCZS* notably skips over the sentence about people believing you even though you have not yet acted. See Ma Chengyuan, *SZCZS*, p. 252.

[69] The phrasing of these statements is confusing. Literally, the author says something to the effect that hardness is "of a bowl" and softness is "of a rope."

[70] *XZMC*, Cai Min, *GDCMZJ*, strips 8 and 9, p. 179. These strips, until the statement about the Four Seas, are missing from the Shanghai version of *XQL*. See Ma Chengyuan, *SZCZS*, pp. 225-6.

world that grab hold of one's nature and shape it accordingly. This is because *jiao* is responsible not just for the development of a moral sense, but also for causing differentiation in the very application of our flexible, indeterminate heart-minds. This broad definition of *jiao* as "upbringing" or "environmental influence" is also strongly suggested in the linguistic analysis provided by the Han lexicographer, Xu Shen, and later commentators to his dictionary.[71]

It is precisely in this more general context that the author of the *XZMC* draws a relationship between human emotions, the heart-mind, and sounds. He develops a psychology of influence, which posits that sounds are a powerful form of *jiao*, or environmental influence, on our emotional and intellectual constitution:

> 凡聲其出於情也信然後其入拔人心也厚聞笑生則鮮如也斯喜聞歌謠則舀如也斯奮聽琴瑟之聲則悸如也斯難
>
> It is generally the case that when sounds exit sincerely via the emotions, they enter and take profound hold of one's heart-mind. When you hear sounds of laughter, you will feel freshness. This is happiness. When you hear singing and chanting, you will feel jovial. This is excitement.[72] When you listen to the sounds of the lute and zither, you will feel stirred. This is distress.[73]

Here, sounds that carry a certain evocative potential seize upon innate elements of the human psyche—both the heart-mind and the emotions deriving from human nature—so as to elicit certain affective responses. One possible interpretation of this process is that emotional states are physically transmitted in the sound itself, and are not merely responses to it.[74] The possibility for such a reading

---

[71] I am indebted to Stephen Durrant for bringing this linguistic nuance to my attention. The term "teachings" is graphically represented in both the Guodian and Shanghai strips with a character 𡥈, which contemporary paleographers take to represent our modern term, *jiao*. According to the commentary to the Shanghai version, this graph can mean both *xue* (to learn), and *jiao* (to teach), and it is defined in the *Shuowen* specifically as *fang*, which is then glossed by Duan Yucai as *xiao*, "to model [oneself upon]." See Ma Chengyuan, *SZCZS*, p. 226.

[72] For the difficult character, *yao* 舀, I follow Li Ling's reading as *dao* 陶. Li Ling, *Guodian zhujian jiaodu ji*, p. 509. Quoted in Goldin, "Xunzi in the Light of the Guodian Manuscripts," p. 132, footnote 69.

[73] *XZMC*, Cai Min et al, 179, strips 23-26. Ma Chengyuan, *SZCZS*, pp. 239-240.

[74] Such a claim is justified through the statement given in the previous example, whereby hardness grabs hold of a bowl and softness grabs hold of a rope. Hardness and softness are not inherent characteristics of either cups or ropes, but external qualities that impress themselves upon the raw materials of cups and ropes. To be sure, this interpretation would need to be based on certain assumptions about *qi* (material force) that are not explicit in the text. While the text does state that

is tempting, especially since later thinkers of the Wei-Jin Dynasty, such as Xi Kang (A.D. 223-62), discussed precisely this topic at length. Xi Kang, whose later essay is titled "Discourse [on the fact] that sound possesses neither sadness nor happiness" (聲無哀樂論), would presumably have refuted claims—some of which might have been made by his Warring States predecessors—that emotions were physically transmitted through sound. But given the lack of explanation in the text, one cannot be sure that the author of the *XZMC* espouses such a materialistic vision.

The scenario above demonstrates that sound is transmitted from one human to the next so as to grab hold of the recipient's heart-mind, subsequently triggering the expression of a certain emotion from within.[75] Clearly, the author of the *XZMC* believes that certain emotions are characteristically present in one's human nature. This means that the process described in the text cannot simply be one in which external forces directly deposit content and agency into a blank slate. For its author, the human body necessarily possesses characteristic responses to external forces. Thus, regardless of whether he believes sound actually contains emotions, or whether he believes that it merely provokes them, the process of sound transmission involves a simple mechanics of outside influence and inside emotional response.

### *From Emotions (Qing 情) to Morality (Yi 義)*

As we just saw, the author of the *XZMC* connects sound to emotions by outlining a mechanics of sound transmission and emotional response. But how does he explain the relationship between the emotions and music? The implicit distinction between *jiao* as environmental influences and *jiao* as the moral teachings of the sages

---

emotions are manifested in the world as *qi* (*XZMC*, Cai Min, *GDCMZJ*, strip 2, p. 179), the question of whether sound actually possesses emotional *qi* or whether it is merely evocative of it remains murky.

[75] I suggest that we keep an open mind about the underlying logic of causality in these texts. We know from scholarship on the ancient Greeks that people maintained certain beliefs in the concreteness of external and internal forces and the permeability of the human body. See Ruth Padel, *In and Out of the Mind: Greek Images of the Tragic Self* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1992), pp. 40-44, 49-59. We must not presume that the ancient Chinese possessed the same conceptions on the transmission and perception of sound that we possess in the present day.

provides critical clues to this relationship. In his discussion of the latter type of *jiao*, the author of the *XZMC* specifies that there is only one kind of Dao that humans can follow.[76] This Dao appears to be grounded in the teachings (*jiao*) of the sages, which is characterized by a specific menu of tradition, composed of (1) the *Odes* (*Poetry/Songs*), (2) the *History* (*Documents*), (3) ritual, and (4) music.[77] Interestingly enough, the author clarifies that "when [these aspects of teachings and tradition] first emerged, they were all produced (given birth) by humans" 其始出皆生於人.[78] The music of the sages, then, unlike other sounds of the universe, is man-made. As a man-made creation, it possesses its roots in the cosmically endowed resources of humans—in particular, the human psyche.[79]

According to the author of the *XZMC*, music represents an agglomeration of sounds that have been worked on by the sages in a systematic, delimiting way. He states of the sage's work:

> 聖人比其類而論會之觀其先後而逢訓之體其義而節度之理其情而出入之
> The sages compared their kinds so as to organize and compile materials; they observed their sequences so as to establish what goes against and follows along with them (?);[80] they gave embodiment to morality (*yi*) and set constraints

[76] *XZMC*, Cai Min, *GDCMZJ*, strips 14 and 15, p. 179. Though there are many ways to interpret the language of this section, the interpretation that makes the most sense to me reads as follows: "There are four methods of the Dao, yet only the Dao for humans is the one that can be followed (taken as a chosen path). The other three methods only lead one inexorably ahead (without choice)." The critical distinction in this reading is that between a chosen path appropriate for humankind and the more determined paths (of Heaven, Earth, and things? The three other "methods" are left unspecified in the text) that work simultaneously upon human life in this world. Interestingly, the Laozian conception of a Dao that cannot be followed (道可道非常道) appears to be a direct response to the claim here that the "Dao for humans is the one that can be followed."

[77] Note that this does not refer to all types of music, but more precisely to the ritually prescribed music in the Zhou tradition that would have been deemed proper by the *Ru* ritual specialists. *XZMC*, Cai Min, *GDCMZJ*, strip 15, p. 179. It is unclear from the text whether the author is referring to these as specific texts or, more generally, as key aspects of a transmitted tradition that might include texts but also point to certain patterns of words, sounds, behaviors, etc.

[78] *XZMC*, Cai Min, *GDCMZJ*, strips 15 and 16, p. 179.

[79] This statement should not be confused with the types of claims Mencius makes concerning the naturally endowed moral agencies in humans. To say that humans are inclined to act morally because moral knowledge, as well as the motivating force underlying moral action, are inherent in every human is very different from claiming that humans have an endowed (intellectual) capacity to create vehicles for moral education such as music and the rites.

[80] The editors of *XQL* transcribe an uncertain character in this passage as

> upon it; and they provided pattern to their emotions so that these might be [properly] expressed and internalized.[81]

As one of the areas of this type of sagely work, music is a creation that makes use of things inherent in human beings—their emotions as well as their processes of thinking, organizing, and ordering—but it is nonetheless distinct from them. As such, music must necessarily be distinct from random sounds that exist without having been created by sagely intent. And, though the text does not state this, the fact that the cultural creations of the sages are based on the patterning of such natural human endowments as the emotions renders them perhaps more naturally amenable as tools for human cultivation.

The *XZMC* also shows how music, as a product of sagely heart-minds, helps individuals express their emotions properly: "He who knows emotions is able to express them; he who knows morality is able to internalize it" 知情者能出之知義者能入之.[82] One will recall that the path of the Dao starts with the individual in the raw and proceeds to transform those raw characteristics and potentials into moral characteristics with emotional value. Music thus serves a means of guiding these raw characteristics and potentials effectively along the human Way:

> 笑喜之薄澤也樂喜之深澤也觀賽武則齊如也斯作觀韶夏則勉如也斯儉養思而動心莫如也其居節也舊其反善復始也慎其出入也順斯其德
> Laughter is the spreading of happiness; joy is the deepening of happiness (*XZMC*: Laughter is the becoming shallow of the rites; music is the deepening of the rites)[83] When you watch the Lai and Wu dances, you will feel confrontational.[84]

---

*ni* (逆),"to go against, counter, defy," rather than *feng* (逢), the character chosen by the editors of *XZMC*. The editors of *XQL* also suggest taking 訓 as 順, a loan for the former, so as to establish a counterpart for *ni*. In this passage I follow the transcription and suggested lexical interpretation found in *XQL*.

[81] *XZMC*, Cai Min, *GDCMZJ*, strips 15-18, p. 179.

[82] Ma Chengyuan, *SZCZS*, p. 222. *XZMC*, Cai Min, *GDCMZJ*, strip 4, p. 179. The three missing characters in this sentence in the *XZMC* are completed by the text of the *SZCZS*. As usual, Qiu Xigui's original speculation about the missing characters turns out to be correct. See *XZMC*, Cai Min, *GDCMZJ*, p. 179, note 3, p. 182.

[83] The graphs in the two versions are at odds here, and this difference changes the meaning significantly. In *SZCZS*, the text refers to happiness (*xi* 喜) in both parts of the phrase, speaking of its extension in two different directions. In *XZMC*, on the other hand, the text makes use of a graph which the editorial board takes to be *li* 禮 (rites), rather than *xi* (happiness). I believe the lexical meaning of *xi* makes more sense in the passage at hand. Cai Min et al, 180, strips 22-3. Ma Chengyuan, *SZCZS*, pp. 238-9.

[84] Taking *qi* 齊 as *ji* 櫅

> This is being incited. When you watch the Shao and Xia dances you will feel focused. This is frugality (?). [Music] nourishes one's thinking and moves the heart-mind so that you feel (dignified?).[85]

Music, which in the text encompasses both aural and visual aspects of performance, makes use of an individual's endowed processes by eliciting certain important affective responses. The experience of these responses in the correct measure helps one arrive at moral goals, or at the Dao that is "near to rightness."[86]

In this passage, the author also shows that various types of music, such as the ancient *Lai*, *Wu*, *Shao*, and *Xia* dance performances, help one become aware of morality because such music is expressive of moral qualities.[87] But what does this mean? The author continues to state that this particular music "resides at length in restraint;[88] carefully reverts back to goodness and repeats itself from the beginning; and is smoothly expressed and internalized. These are its virtues." 其居次舊其反善復始也慎其出入也順司其德也[89] Taken metaphorically, such statements liken music to a cultivated gentleman. A more literal, phenomenological reading of this passage, however, suggests that this music possesses qualities that the psyche perceives to be moral. One might then ask: is it the psyche that perceives of morality through music, or is morality inherent in the sounds themselves?

From the statement that music "observantly reverts back to goodness," one might be led to believe that goodness is an inherent quality of proper music. However, in the beginning of the text the author demonstrates to us that there is a distinction between the act of deeming good and bad—which stems from our nature—and the external reality which one deems good or bad.[90] Although he does not go on to comment on whether goodness and evil lie within things of themselves, he clearly indicates that our perceptual responses (the deeming of good and bad) are distinct from the external realities to

---

[85] *XZMC*, Cai Min, *GDCMZJ*, strips 26-7, p. 180.

[86] *XZMC*, Cai Min, *GDCMZJ*, strips 2-3, p. 179.

[87] Texts to the "Lai" and "Wu" can be found in the extant *Book of Odes*. They are numbers 295 and 285, respectively. The "Shao" is a music associated with the legendary Emperor Shun, while the "Xia" is associated with Emperor Yu the Great, the legendary founder of the historically dubious Xia dynasty.

[88] The term *jiu* 舊 is tentatively read by the commentator to XQL as *jiu* 久. Ma Chengyuan, *SZCZS*, p. 244.

[89] *XZMC*, Cai Min, *GDCMZJ*, strips 26-7, p. 180.

[90] *XZMC*, Cai Min, *GDCMZJ*, strips 4-5, p. 179.

which they are linked. It would seem, then, that morality might not literally reside in music, but that music might be perceived of as an object that can be deemed good or bad. So, while the passage depicts music as morally evocative just as it is emotionally evocative, it does not necessarily mean that music possesses morality in itself. The most one can justifiably claim from the statements above is that musical performances are acts that express something akin to moral behavior. And, as an expression of moral behavior, music helps serve as a legitimate tool for individual cultivation.

How, to sum up, does music transmit moral knowledge? An example perhaps provides the best explanation: The *Shao* and *Xia* musical performances convey the "heart-mind" (intentions, aims, attitudes) lying behind the acts of the sage leaders, Shun and Yu, as they ruled in antiquity. Such a heart-mind seizes upon the listener, who can—via this music—perceive most directly the austerity of such leadership. This feeling of austerity interacts with the natural emotions of the listener, giving him or her a sense of how this emotion, among other related emotions, might properly be expressed. It also provides him or her with a means of judging, understanding, and internalizing the good heart-mind of the sages. In other words, music grabs hold of an individual's psyche (emotions and heart-mind), while the psyche serves as a passive, yet characteristic receptor of its expressive and informative content.

### *Music and the Process of "Seeking one's Heart-mind"*

The author of the *XZMC* does not merely recommend music as a viable means to moral cultivation. Music, he claims, holds paramount importance over other forms of teachings, for it is the quickest means of "seeking one's heart-mind" (*qiu qi xin* 求其心).[91] This particular psychological goal, which appears in the *Mencius* as well, suggests that individuals uncover aspects of the heart-mind—

[91] Intriguingly, this statement connecting the practice of "seeking one's heart-mind" and music is not present in the *XQL* version of the text. In that version the author discusses the value of "seeking one's heart-mind" specifically in relationship to teachings and the presence of "artifice" (*wei* 僞) in such a pursuit, but does not assert the superior and unique role of music. Ma Chengyuan, *SZCZS*, pp. 265-6. For a more in-depth analysis of the possible interpretations of "seeking one's heart-mind" in early Confucianism, see my article, "Music and 'Seeking One's Heart-mind' in the *Xing Zi Ming Chu*," *Dao, A Journal of Comparative Philosophy* V. 2 (June 2006).

intentions, motivations, and aims—that underlie the surface actions and dispositions of others or themselves.[92] It can be compared with Confucius's distinction in the *Analects* between the simple ritual action, devoid of the proper attitude or feeling, and ritual action performed with full sincerity or reverence.[93] The *XZMC* states:

> 凡學者求其心爲難從其所爲近得之矣不如以樂之速也
> In general the difficult thing about learning is "seeking one's heart-mind." If one follows from what one has done, one is close to obtaining it, but it is not comparable to the speed with which music achieves the same end.[94]

Here, the author introduces the practice of "seeking one's heart-mind," recommends it and asserts its difficulty to attain, then proceeds to claim that music is the single-most effective vehicle for achieving this end.[95] This is quite a tall order for music, which has up to this point in the text represented but one of four traditional tools for self-cultivation (the *Odes*, *Documents*, and ritual serving as the other three). But how does music relate to this process of "seeking one's heart-mind"?

The text offers few but sufficient clues. In the following statement, we learn that the act of possessing the heart-mind is distinct from merely carrying out an action, for it points to a psychological dimension—the possession of conviction—that presumably bears upon such an action. We also learn that there is a distinction between possessing (or obtaining) one's heart-mind and seeking after it:

> 雖能其事不能其心不貴求其心有爲也弗得之矣人之不能以爲也可知也
> Though one might be able to accomplish an affair, if one cannot [possess] one's heart-mind, then it is worthless. If one "seeks after the heart-mind" with purpose, one will not obtain it. That one cannot use purpose [to obtain it] can be known indeed.[96]

---

[92] Compare with passages which refer to this practice in the *Mencius* 1A7 and 6A11. Translations read: "When I reflected [upon myself] and sought it, I did not obtain my heart," and "letting go of one's heart without knowing to seek after it." Indeed, each text appears to use the term in its own way. Many thanks to P.J. Ivanhoe for pointing out these other usages.

[93] See *Analects* 2.7, 2.8, and 3.12, which, though they all demand that some sort of inner presence accompany an action, do not really locate this inner reality in any explicit psychology or discourse on heart-mind.

[94] *XZMC*, Cai Min, *GDCMZJ*, strip 36, p. 180.

[95] *XZMC*, Cai Min, *GDCMZJ*, strips 36-38, p. 180.

[96] *XZMC*, Cai Min, *GDCMZJ*, strips 37-8, p. 180.

In the process of "seeking one's heart-mind," one must abandon all sense of purpose in order to get to it. Since the previous passage told us that music provides the quickest means of obtaining the heart-mind, we may now assume that music is also the quickest vehicle for abandoning one's sense of purpose in seeking after it.

It thus appears that music is valued as effective in "seeking one's heart-mind" because it represents an almost unmediated mode of attaining some kind of knowledge about it. The author is implicitly denigrating methods of attaining knowledge of the heart-mind that include too much concerted mental effort. Even from the first statement in the text, where he presents the problem of an indeterminate, or unfixed, heart-mind, he displays his unease with the flexibility or corruptibility of the heart-mind. It is in music that he finds something to allay his fears, for music serves as an external stimulus that most directly transmits knowledge without allowing the heart-mind to adulterate or corrupt it through too much mental effort. As the most effective and least hermeneutically suspicious vehicle in moral self-cultivation, music stands at the pinnacle of the *jiao* in the *XZMC*.

By discussing music in terms of its unadulterated impact on human emotions and morality, the author of *XZMC* establishes the primacy of music as a vehicle for self-cultivation. He outlines a psychology of influence that explains why music is both effective and efficient in moral transformation of the human body. Though he does not equate proper music with the workings of the natural cosmos, his explanation of its origins in the heart-mind of the sage and his belief in the close affinity between music and the emotions suggest that music interacts naturally and organically with the human psyche. The author's attempt to link music and the cosmic, or Heavenly endowed aspects of our psyche constitutes an initial step in the direction of viewing music as an integral component of the cosmos.

### *Xunzi's "Discourse on Music": Harnessing the Psyche of Society*

Another Confucian text that discusses music according to a psychology of influence is the "Discourse on Music" ("Yue Lun" 樂論) of Xunzi.[97] Like the *XZMC*, Xunzi's account on music underscores

[97] I have benefited greatly from consideration of Scott Cook's translation of

its role as a vehicle for attaining a desired psychological stance that is independent from, yet partially derivative of, the cosmos. Xunzi, however, takes psychology even further beyond the scope of self-cultivation, to the social and political realms. He formulates an interesting view on mass psychology that serves as a natural extension of his views on individual cultivation of the psyche. Also unlike the author of the *XZMC*, Xunzi idealizes music as a representation or duplication of cosmic operations. In such a way, his writings on music aptly reflect the changing status of music as it parallels changes in the notion of harmony and gains cosmic importance.

The "Discourse on Music" agrees with the *XZMC* in arguing for the inevitable influence of sounds and music over human emotions. The logic behind such musical apologetics lies in the claim that the effects of music on human bodies are both profound and quick. One sees this clearly in the following famous phrase: "Musical sounds enter into people deeply and transform people quickly" 夫聲樂之入人也深其化人也速.[98] The deep and transformative power of proper music (i.e., music that helps lead one on the Dao) in self-cultivation guides the emotions, which are linked to the psychology of the body. Moreover, the relationship between music and the emotions is necessary: "Thus Music is the great evening of all under Heaven; it is the ordering of centrality and harmony; and it is that which human emotions simply cannot avoid" 故樂者天下之大齊也中和之紀也人情之所必不免也.[99] In this passage emotions "simply cannot avoid" music because they lie in a necessarily causal relationship to

---

the entire "Yue Lun," in Cook, "Unity and Diversity," pp. 413-428. Many of my translations are taken or adapted from his work. In addition to Cook's dissertation on music, I have benefited from an unpublished work by Eric Hutton on this topic. For an excellent translation of the complete Xunzi, see John Knoblock, *Xunzi: A Translation and Study of the Complete Works, vols. 1-3* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1988-1994).

[98] *Xunzi*, Chapter 20. Xiong Gongzhe, trans. and ed., *Xunzi jinzhu jinyi*, pp. 414-15. I believe Xunzi uses the rare construction, "*sheng yue*" (聲樂), to highlight the component of the aural parts of music, as opposed to the visual parts that also would have comprised such performances. Also, I am thankful to an anonymous reader of this essay for pointing out the similar use of the term *ye* 也 in this statement and in the *XZMC* (*XZMC*, Cai Min, *GDCMZJ*, strips 23-26, p. 179; Ma Chengyuan, *SZCZS*, pp. 239-240), cited above. The placement of the adverb after *ye* seems unique, and more work will need to be done to determine whether this was a standard way of writing, or whether it indicates a textual connection or a linguistic affinity between the author of the *XZMC* and Xunzi.

[99] *Xunzi*, translation adapted from Cook, "Unity and Diversity," pp. 416-7.

it, as well as to the centrality and harmony that it produces. One can thus conclude that the emotions are inevitably elicited, shaped, and transformed upon their encounters with proper music.

For Xunzi, sounds might be divided into many sorts, but there are two predominant types of human responses to any given sound: those that lead to order and those that lead to chaos. In either case, sounds naturally induce a powerful reaction from individuals, as seen in the following, step-by-step account of a psychology of musical influence:

> 凡姦聲感人而逆氣應之逆氣成象而亂生焉正聲感人而順氣應之順氣成象而治生焉唱和有應善惡相象故君子慎其所去就也
> In general, when licentious sounds stimulate a person, a contrary material energy [from within] responds to them. When this contrary material energy takes outward form, disorder is produced therein. When proper sounds stimulate a person, an agreeable material energy [from within] responds to them. When this agreeable material energy takes outward form, order is produced therein. Shouts and harmonies each have their own responses, and good and bad are each in turn given outward forms—thus the nobleman is cautious in what he approaches or leaves behind.[100]

Unlike the *XZMC*, whose author sees sound as something that takes hold of the heart-mind so as to effect certain emotions, Xunzi does not explicitly refer to "heart-mind" in his explanation, choosing instead to focus more directly on material energy (*qi*), a notion of physiological as well as psychological relevance. His discussion of the psychology of influence intriguingly refers to the technical phrase, "stimulus-response" (*ganying* 感應), which later becomes a dominant concept for explaining the mechanics of influence that occurs between the human body and events in the cosmos.[101] By focusing on the

---

[100] *Xunzi*, Chapter 20. This same passage, with slight differences, can be found in the "Yueji" 樂記 ("Record of Music") from the *Book of Rites*, discussed below. *Liji*, 19 ("Yueji," Part 2,), p. 1003. The term *xiang* 相 in this passage is confusing. I take it to refer to good and bad each in turn, and not to the mutual relationship between them. See Cook for a similar way of getting around the problem with this term, loc. cit., p. 422, note 82.

[101] The belief in causality according to stimulus and response (*ganying*) came to dominate Han Dynasty concepts of music and social order. Though Xunzi uses this technical terminology here, the mechanics that he suggests is very similar to that described in the *XZMC*, which is less specific or technical in its terminology. It seems likely that such terminology was just becoming popular in Xunzi's time, or that Xunzi was one of the foremost thinkers to coin the phrase. In many ways, the psychology of influence, stemming from discourses on music and outlined by Xunzi and his predecessor in the *XZMC*, provides us with a template for the

movement of material energy, Xunzi's description of the interaction between sound and sentiment is even more explicitly embodied than that found in the *XZMC*.[102]

In the passage above, emotional responses to music can be expressed, via material energy, through physical cues that help bring about a certain degree of social order. By stressing the physical accommodation of the body to sound, this type of formulation appears to heighten the sense of immediacy and inevitability with which the transaction between sound and body takes place. Music is no longer just the most effective tool for attaining a certain state of heart-mind: it is a powerfully influential, manipulative, and fool-proof device for eliciting certain uncontrolled responses from the entire body, including the heart-mind. Social order is the result of proper music because the latter necessarily elicits an individual's appropriate physical response, such as a reverent attitude and moral behavior, to his or her environment.

But Xunzi does not stop with the individual human body. He goes on to elucidate how music brings about a much larger sense of psychological wellbeing:

---

notion of *ganying* that became popular during the Han Dynasty. For discussions on the concept of *ganying* in Han times, see Sarah Queen, *From Chronicle to Canon: The Hermeneutics of Spring and Autumn, According to Tung Chun-shu* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996); and the review of this work by Anne Cheng in *Early China* 23-24 (1998), pp. 353-66. See also Martin Kern, "Religious Anxiety and Political Interest in Western Han Omen Interpretation: The Case of the Han Wudi Period (141-87 B.C.)," *Studies in Chinese History* 10 (2000), pp. 1-31; and Sivin, "State, Cosmos, and the Body," pp. 5-37.

[102] One might explain this account of the mechanics of sound and sentiment as follows: emotions are transmitted through *qi* 氣 (material force), which, while possessing a certain quality of energy, does not yet take on any specific external form. The human body may give *qi* an outward form through one's demeanor, action, sounds, aura, etc. Agreeable or disagreeable forms give rise to order or chaos in one's environment. Agreeable energies are those that produce order, while disagreeable ones are those that produce chaos.

The use of the word *xiang* 象 (form) in this description is interesting and ambiguous. Xunzi, in his precise manner of thinking, wishes to distinguish between the quality and amount of *qi* on the one hand, and its embodied manifestation in some physical form in the human body on the other. *Xiang* seems to refer to this physical expression of *qi*. For an interesting interpretation of the notion of outward form in the attached commentaries to the *Yijing*, see Willard Peterson, "Making Connections: Commentary on the Attached Verbalizations," *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies*, vol. 42, no.1 (1982), pp. 67-116.

故樂行而志清禮修而行成耳目聰明血氣和平移風易俗天下皆寧美善相樂
Therefore, when [proper] music is played, one's will becomes clear, and when rites are cultivated, one's conduct is brought to fruition. The ears and eyes are perspicacious and acute, blood and material energy are harmonious and in equilibrium, cultural habits and customs change, all under heaven is tranquil, and the beautiful and good each in turn [give rise to] joy.[103]

To Xunzi, proper music along with the rites produces a series of beneficial results: they induce desirable psychological and physiological reactions, bring about a state of environmental and social order, and go on to produce an ultimate state of psychological well-being—that of joy 樂—in all humans of a given society. Xunzi's descriptions of the effects of music on psychology thus run full circle from music to individual to society, and then back around again to every individual psyche within a certain society. The joy to which he alludes is therefore not merely individual joy; it is a shared joy that corresponds to the psychological health of society.

The "Discourse on Music" abounds with passages attesting to this socio-psychological role of music. The following section demonstrates the causal link between different kinds of sounds, general attitudes and behaviors of the masses, and even the security of a state:

樂姚冶以險則民流僈鄙賤矣流僈則亂鄙賤則爭亂爭則兵弱城犯敵國危之
When music is seductive and precipitous, the people will be indulgent and lowly. Indulgent, they will wreak chaos; lowly, they will be contentious. With chaos and contention, the military will be weak, city walls will be violated, and enemy states will bring peril.[104]

Here, music brings about general attitudes and behaviors that translate directly into deeper and deeper levels of social disorder. The clear function of music is to maintain the well-being and security of the state—a function that goes above and beyond its use as a vehicle for individuals to attain the Dao.

For Xunzi, music serves as "the most magnificent means of ruling the people"(治人之盛者也), because it harnesses and directs mass psychology so as to aid in sociopolitical control.[105] Its content and styles must therefore be guarded and preserved through strict state supervision:

---

[103] *Xunzi*, Chapter 20, Xiong Gongzhe, ed., p. 415. This same passage, with slight differences, can be found in the "Yueji," *Liji*, 19 ("Yueji, Part 2,"), p. 1005.
[104] *Xunzi*, translated by Cook, "Unity and Diversity," p. 419.
[105] Ibid., pp. 423-4.

其在序官曰修憲命審誅賞禁淫聲以時順修使夷俗邪音不敢亂雅太師之事也
It is said in the "Ordering of Offices": "Revising the mandates of the charter, examining the stanzas of the Odes, forbidding excessive sounds, and making revisions in smooth and timely fashion, so that barbarous customs and depraved music will not dare wreak havoc upon the elegant—these are the duties of the Music Master."[106]

Beautiful compositions of the past, embodied primarily in the *Odes*, should be promulgated so that people do not wrongly descend into depravity through the act of choosing their own sounds. By proclaiming music to be a powerful means of mass psychological regulation, and by further asserting the superiority of Zhou musical styles over other more alien tunes in bringing about unified states of psychological well-being, Xunzi creates a clear rationale for Confucian practices from the perspective of more imperial forms of control.[107]

Xunzi joins the author of the *XZMC* in proclaiming a close and profound influence of sound and music over one's psychological state. Unique to Xunzi is the claim that music immediately affects the entire physiology of a person, and not just one's emotions or heart-mind. Also unique to Xunzi is a clearly social and political aspect of his psychology on music. Rather than focusing exclusively on processes of individual cultivation, as does the author of the *XZMC*, Xunzi orients his discussion of music around its social effects as well.[108] By claiming that a ruler's choice of music can help bring about a unified affective state in the people, Xunzi projects the psychological effects of musical self-cultivation onto an entire population. He therefore presents music as a tool for influencing mass psychology and, thus, as an instrument for establishing a more thoroughly unified state.

---

[106] Ibid., pp. 419-420.

[107] Though the theory is speculative, Robert Eno details a possible etymology of the term *Ru* ("Confucian") that links it to dance masters whose duty it is to tame and civilize. This intriguing connection, if true, would certainly help explain the special Confucian interest in music as a source for promoting social order and reinforcing feelings of Hua-Xia ("Chinese") identity. See Robert Eno, *The Confucian Creation of Heaven: Philosophy and the Defense of Ritual Mastery* (Albany: State University of New York, 1990), pp. 190-197.

[108] As many scholars have noticed, this emphasis can largely be attributed to Xunzi's ostensible purpose in writing this account of refuting the Mohist attack on music. See Cook, "Unity and Diversity," p. 429. In my view, this is indeed the case, as Xunzi seems determined to counter the Mohist claim that music makes a negative social impact with an argument that it provides a very positive one.

The two Confucian writings that we have just examined stress the importance of using music to achieve an idealized psychology and/or state of social cohesion and order. Both texts agree that cultivation of the emotions is critical to moral cultivation according to the Dao, and that music is a primary vehicle for shaping one's *qing*. The fact that music speaks directly to the emotions demonstrates that it possesses an especially close affinity to what is cosmically inherent in humans. This much is shared between the texts. But two significant differences are worth noting. First, as demonstrated above, the *Xunzi* goes beyond the confines of individual psychology to posit the influence of music on mass psychology and the unity and coherence of a state. This difference points to changes in the sociopolitical climate informing Confucian writings since the 4th century B.C. In particular, it can be related to the Central States' adoption of centralizing theories and policies during the 3rd century B.C.[109]

Second, Xunzi also suggests that music goes beyond both individuals and societies to bring about order on the largest possible scale. This is because music mimics the harmonious operations of the cosmos:

> 舞意天道兼鼓其樂之君邪故鼓似天鐘似地磬似水竽笙（簫和）筦籥似星辰日月柷拊鞉椌楬似萬物
> ...and the meaning of the dance is as universal as Heaven's Dao.[110] The drum—is it not the ruler of music? Thus, the drums resemble Heaven; the bells resemble Earth; the chime stones resemble water; the *yu* and *sheng* mouth-organs, the flutes, and the pipes resemble the stars, the planets, the sun, and the moon;[111] and the swivel-drums, woodblocks, shakers, and mallets resemble the myriad things.[112]

While the *XZMC* does not assert the power of music beyond individual self-cultivation, Xunzi points out that proper music, though

---

[109] More specific reasons why Xunzi might have espoused such views still remain in the realm of conjecture.

[110] I understand the term *jian* 兼 in reference to the Mohists' use of it as "universal," or representing that which is shared and not particular to any single object.

[111] Following the comment by Wang Yin 王引 regarding a corrupt previous usage of the phrase *xiao he* (簫和), it is likely that the presence of these two terms in the list of instruments is also a later editorial mistake. I therefore do not translate them here. See Xunzi, Xiong Gongzhe, ed., p. 418, note 4.

[112] *Xunzi,* Chapter 20. Translation slightly adapted from Scott Cook 1995, p. 425-6. For more information on the large and small mouth organs (*yu* and *sheng*), see Feng Guangsheng, "Winds," in *Music in the Age of Confucius*, ed. Jenny F. So (Washington D. C.: Freer Gallery of Art and Arthur M. Sackler Gallery, 2000), pp. 87-99.

undeniably a creation of the human realm, actually represents or points to the cosmos in its full plumage. Without going so far as to claim that music influences cosmic operations, he asserts its resemblance to and mimicry of cosmic processes of creation, order, and transformation.

Xunzi's idealizations of music foreshadow what becomes normative in many later writings: a belief in the power of music to complete and fulfill cosmic operations. The subtle differences between Xunzi's views and those of the *XZMC* therefore illuminate some important developments concerning the changing relationships among music, the psyche, and the cosmos. In particular, they highlight the pending elevation of music from that which cultivates individuals and brings harmony in society to that which cultivates individuals, promotes social order, and helps bring about the natural harmony of Heaven and Earth on a cosmic scale.

## A Psychology of Cosmic Attunement

### *The Cosmic Repercussions of Music in the "*Yueji*"*

Scholars have consistently linked Xunzi's "*Yue lun*" ("Discourse on Music") to somewhat later accounts of music found in the "Yueshu" ("The Book on Music") of Sima Qian's *Shiji* and the "Yueji" ("Account on Music") of the Confucian Classic, *Liji*.[113] Because the "Yueshu" is likely a rip-off version of the "Yueji" that was not written by Sima Qian, I will refer more simply to the "Yueji" when referencing these texts.[114] While the influence of Xunzi's "Discourse on Music" over

[113] In terms of the dating of the "Yueji," I agree with Cook, who dates the compilation to the Western Han, but adds that much of its content would have stemmed from Warring States materials. For textual information on the "Yueshu," see the note below.

[114] The two texts, "Yueshu," and "Yueji," contain many passages that are virtually identical, and they are similar in general. Chinese scholarship since Tang times has reached a general consensus that the "Yueshu" was not written by Sima Qian. See Yu Jiaxi, "Liji Yueji yu Shiji Yueshu," in *Yueji lunbian*, ed. Zhao Feng (Beijing, Renmin yinyue, 1983), pp. 56-67. For an informative account of the similarities between these texts and the likely dating and historical context of "Yueshu," see Martin Kern, "A Note on the Authenticity and Ideology of *Shih-chi* 24, 'Yueshu,'" in *Journal of the American Oriental Society* 119.4 (1999), pp. 763-677. According to Kern, almost ninety percent of the text, "Yueshu," "is virtually identical with the complete *Li-chi* chapter 'Records of Music,' differing only in some textual variants

the "Yueji" appears to be great, there are noticeable differences in how this later text draws connections between music and both cosmos and psyche. In particular, the "Yueji," while reflecting largely traditional concerns about the role of music in self-cultivation and broader education, incorporates a belief that music can complete, rather than merely represent or duplicate, the cosmos.

The "Yueji" speaks of music in terms of its cosmic significance and affinity with natural principles. It claims: "Great music conforms with the harmony of Heaven and Earth" 大樂與天地同和.[115] In a similar vein, it states: "Music is that which penetrates [natural] principle and pattern"樂者通倫理者也.[116] The fact that "great music," or music that achieves a certain ideal of perfection, both conforms with cosmic harmony and penetrates principles and patterns intrinsic to the cosmos, suggests an expanded role for music. Music does more than just represent or allude to cosmic harmony. It synchronizes itself with the natural rhythms of Heaven and Earth so as to contribute to the overall harmony of the cosmos.

This view of music as an agent of cosmic harmony is further strengthened through the author's assertions that great music, along with its counterpart, ritual, enhance cosmic operations:

> 及夫禮樂之極乎天而蟠乎地行乎陰陽而通乎鬼神窮高極遠而測深厚樂著太始而禮居成物著不息者天也著不動者地也一動一靜者天地之間也故聖人曰禮云樂云
> As for ritual and music perfecting Heaven and relying on Earth, moving along with Yin-yang and penetrating [the realms of] ghosts and spirits, they exhaust what is high and reach the limits of the distant, plumbing all depths. Music illuminates the Great Beginning while ritual abides in the completion of things. That which illuminates without rest is Heaven; that which illuminates without movement is Earth. One moving, the other tranquil, this is the interaction between Heaven and Earth.[117] Thus the sage says: "Ritual, ah! Music, ah!"[118]

---

and an alternative arrangement of a few paragraphs" (p. 673). Kern convincingly demonstrates that Sima Qian is unlikely to have composed the received version of "Yueshu" (pp. 673-677). However, it should be noted that when Kern suggests a late Western/early Eastern Han dating for the "Yueshu" and "Yueji," he refers exclusively to the creation of these as specific texts, not to the dating of much of their content.

[115] *Liji*, 19 ("Yueji, Part 1"), p. 988. Sima Qian, *Shiji*, vol. 4 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1992), p. 24 ("Yueshu"), p. 1189.

[116] *Liji*, 19 ("Yueji, Part 1"), p. 982. Sima, *Shiji* 24, p. 1184. Though it is not clear here whether the author is referring to cosmic or natural principle and pattern, it makes sense in light of the statement preceding this passage to interpret principle and pattern as having to do with the inherent workings of the heart-mind.

[117] The commentator to "Yueshu," Zheng Xuan, takes the term *xian* as the

In this passage, the author underscores how ritual and music possess the power to aid in cosmic operations. Music and ritual are capable of "perfecting Heaven and relying on Earth," of exhausting "what is high" and "plumbing all depths," and of illuminating "the Great Beginning" and abiding "in the completion of things." In short, they both participate in and enhance the basic operations of the cosmos.

In addition to accentuating, aiding, and participating in cosmic processes, great music also gives critical efficacy to cosmic operations. Music necessarily completes the cosmos:

> 樂者敦和率神而從天禮者別宜居鬼而從地故聖人作樂以應天制禮以配地禮樂明備天地官矣
> Music is lovely and harmonious; it directs spirits and follows along with Heaven. Ritual is discriminating and fitting; it secures ghosts and follows along with Earth. Therefore the sage creates music to respond [appropriately] to Heaven; creates ritual to be congruent with Earth. When ritual and music are clarified and perfected, Heaven and Earth [can fulfill] their functions.[119]

On the one hand, the author describes music and ritual as human responses to the cosmic realm—responses that interact with Heaven and Earth in a harmonious and appropriate manner. On the other hand, as made clear in the statements about directing the spirits, securing ghosts, and helping Heaven and Earth fulfill their various functions, the author also shows that the actual efficacy of cosmic operations depends on the perfection and clarification of human music and ritual. Because of the intrinsic connection between the state of music and cosmic operations, one can look to music as an indicator of how successfully the cosmos is functioning. Similarly, one can control music so that cosmic processes may be fulfilled effectively. As part of the fabric of the cosmos, music provides humans with a means of tapping into its powers so as to insure the smoothness and functionality of its operations.

---

"hundred things," or multiplicity of earthly objects which rely on Heaven and Earth. Note that in the *Liji* the same passage uses the term *jian* rather than *xian*. I believe Zheng Xuan is correct in filling in what is unspoken in the text, as *xian* might more literally be translated as *jian*, "between."

[118] *Liji*, 19 ("Yueji, Part 1"), p. 994. Sima, *Shiji* 24, p. 1196. I take *yun* 云 here to be an interjection.

[119] *Liji*, 19 ("Yueji, Part 1"), p. 992. Sima, *Shiji* 24, p. 1193.

*Cosmic Music, Cosmic Psyche*

How does the relationship between music and cosmic operation affect the way these authors view the relationship between music and psyche? Again, the "Yueji" deviates just enough from the *Xunzi* to make it interesting as a text that builds on earlier beliefs while changing with the times. As seen above, one significant difference from Xunzi's "Discourse" is the greater emphasis the author of "Yueji" places on music as a means of cosmic control, rather than just state control or self-cultivation. Another important difference is that the author of "Yueji" discusses how the human psyche might confirm the authenticity of great music. Unlike the *XZMC* and *Xunzi*, which speak almost exclusively about how music affects humans and society, the "Yueji" pays special attention to the issue of how humans can come to know about and authenticate music by attuning their own heart-minds to the cosmos. Such a focus attests to a new effort to exhort rulers to know music (or sponsor those who do), so that they might employ the right type of music in state control.[120] It completes the triadic relationship between music, cosmos, and psyche that developed during the late Warring States and early imperial periods.

In the "Yueji," great music is true, or authentic, because it conforms to cosmic principles and harmonies. As cosmic music, it has the power to help bring about social and natural order. This places music squarely within a cosmic schema of control that easily lends itself to the interests of the state. Music can serve both as a fundamental tool to help effect social and cosmic order as well as a rhetorical tool to justify a ruler's claims to cosmic power. For these reasons, it is in the interests of those who control music to be able to judge music on the basis of its cosmic efficacy—or whether or not it truly is great, or cosmic, music.

The author thus exerts a considerable amount of effort to delineate just who is capable of knowing and making decisions about music:

[120] This difference suggests a slight shift in preliminary assumptions. For example, while Xunzi takes pains to argue the more general case that music comprises a major form of state control, these authors begin from the assumption that this is indeed true, but that states need some means of identifying what types of music are most effective in such an endeavor. In other words, the author of "Yueji" assumes that the state knows about the benefits of utilizing music in state control. He therefore focuses his attention on how leaders in a state might be assured of conducting the right types of music.

"Therefore, he who knows the nature of ritual and music is able to initiate, and he who understands the patterns of ritual and music is able to complete. He who initiates is referred to as 'sagely,' he who completes is referred to as 'clear'" 故知禮樂之情者能作識禮樂之文者能術作者之謂聖術者之謂明.[121] Here, knowledge about ritual and music is an enabling factor that legitimizes one's sagely qualities. Music is not just something that helps one learn and become moral; it is something in and of itself that a sage might master and come to understand.

Significantly, the "Yueji" explains why sages are capable of knowing and making decisions about great music. It does this by linking the human heart-mind with a Heavenly nature that is inherent from birth: "That humans at birth are tranquil is because of their Heavenly nature. That they are stimulated by external things and are moved by them is because of the expression of this nature"人生而靜天之性也感於物而動性之頌也.[122] Moreover, this author claims, humans are endowed with an innate framework, called "Heaven's pattern" 天理, and this framework is congruent with the harmony of great music.[123] We know that this framework is good because the loss of it leads to utmost disorder in one's actions and heart-mind. For example, when one is influenced by external things without being able to reflect upon the self, and when one does not have any sense of measure in one's likes and dislikes, "Heaven's pattern is destroyed" 天理滅也.[124] Furthermore, when Heaven's pattern is destroyed, "one will possess an intractable and conniving heart-mind" 有悖逆詐僞之心, which will give rise to disorderly affairs.[125] Through such passages, the author establishes an intrinsic correspondence between cosmos and the human constitution. But who can abide in this intrinsic pattern?

Since great music stems from the cosmic processes of Heaven and Earth, it stands to reason that only he who can preserve the original imprint of Heaven's pattern on his heart-mind will be able to understand such music, and vice versa. The text shows us that

---

[121] *Liji*, 19 ("Yueji, Part 1"), p. 989. Sima, *Shiji* 24, p. 1189-1190.

[122] *Liji*, 19 ("Yueji, Part 1"), p. 984. Sima, *Shiji* 24, p. 1186. The "Yueji" refers to the term "desires" (*yu* 欲) where the "Yueshu" uses the word "expression" (*song* 頌). I have chosen to translate the phrase using the term *song*.

[123] *Liji*, 19 ("Yueji, Part 1"), p. 984. Sima, *Shiji* 24, p. 1186.

[124] Ibid.

[125] Ibid.

the sages originally created music.[126] It also claims that only the gentleman is capable of understanding it.[127] Underlying these claims is the implication that only these types of men are able to keep their own, psychological sense of "Heaven's pattern" intact. Such an implication is new and not found in the *XZMC* or *Xunzi*.[128] Notably, neither of these texts defines human achievement or the creation of music in terms of the simple preservation of what was inherent in the psyche from the beginning. In "Yueji," however, not only does the human psyche derive from the natural world; it is endowed with an imprint of Heaven's pattern that it can use to create, understand, and even legitimize great music in the world. The connection between the cosmos and music that is created and apprehended by the idealized human psyche is therefore complete. Great music exists not only because the sages worked hard to create it, but because they were able to preserve the Heavenly pattern endowed in them from birth and put it to use in the production of great music.

Our analysis of the "Yueji" demonstrates how the human psyche begins to represent a functional blueprint for idealized cosmic operations. As such, it possesses the potential to create, apprehend, and evaluate types of music that truly engage and embody the harmonies inherent in the cosmos. Rather than merely demonstrate the power of music to help cultivate an impressionable psyche, the author of the "Yueji" asserts the fundamental power of the human psyche to authenticate music by virtue of its own intrinsic connection to the cosmos. Such a perspective invokes the powers of the cosmic psyche so as to insure the promulgation of great music, which in turn helps bring about cosmic order.

### *A Psychology of Cosmic Attunement in the* Lüshi chunqiu *and* Zhuangzi

We find striking examples of a psychology of cosmic attunement in texts dating from the late Warring States period that do not maintain an ostensibly Confucian agenda. The discussion of music in the

---

[126] See, for example, *Liji*, 19 ("Yueji, Part 1"), p. 995. Sima, *Shiji* 24, p. 1197.

[127] *Liji*, 19 ("Yueji, Part 1"), p. 982. Sima, *Shiji* 24, p. 1184.

[128] Arguably, these passages on human nature seem to draw very heavily on the *XZMC*, more than they do on Xunzi's writings. Still, the claims and terms are slightly different from the ones in *XZMC*, which never promoted the preservation of "Heaven's pattern" (but, rather, the shaping of Heaven's nature) as an ideal of self-cultivation.

"music chapters" of the *Lüshi chunqiu*, for example, revolves around the creation, production, apprehension, and understanding of cosmic music. To a greater extent than in the "Yueji," the author of the "music chapters" of *Lüshi chunqiu* discusses music in terms of its cosmic connections. For example, in his impressionistic account of the genesis of music in "Great Music" ("Dayue" 大樂), one learns that (1) music is inherent in the processes and principles of cosmos, (2) sound is intrinsic to the very shapes and forms of everything in the cosmos, and (3) the music of the Former Kings (or sages) is based on principles of creating harmony out of the sounds inherent in the cosmos.[129] Indeed, there is a true cosmic nature (*qing* 情) to great music, just as there is a true nature to humankind (*xing* 性).[130] It is the job of the sage to insure that an idealized, triangular relationship among music, cosmos, and psyche remains complete.

According to the text, because only a sage can produce music of cosmic efficacy, knowledge of how to become a sage is of primary importance. Similar to the discussion in the "Yueji," the sage must ready his heart-mind so as to understand music and allow it to "come to fruition" (*cheng* 成).[131] The key to this lies in attaining a state of "equilibrium" (*ping* 平), which appears to be a state in which the psyche regains the cosmic balance that is original to it: "There is a method for working on music. It must necessarily emerge from equilibrium. Equilibrium emerges from impartiality, impartiality from the Dao. Thus, only a man who has attained the Dao can discourse on music!" 務樂有術必由平出平出於公公出於道故惟得道之人其可與言樂乎.[132] The equilibrium of the human heart-mind according to the Dao constitutes the psychological prerequisite for one's correct involvement with music. Thus, proper self-cultivation involves preparing one's psyche to be in balance with the cosmic Dao before one can understand, let alone produce and reap the benefits from, great music.

The "Heaven Chapters" of *Zhuangzi* also speak of attaining an idealized state of psychic attainment that results in the production of cosmic music. Although the type of music the authors refer to

---

[129] Lü Buwei, *Lüshi Chunqiu jiaoshi* 5.2 ("Dayue"), pp. 255-6.
[130] Lü Buwei, *Lüshi Chunqiu jiaoshi* 5.2 ("Dayue"), p. 266.
[131] Ibid.
[132] Ibid.; translation slightly altered from Riegel and Knoblock, p. 137.

does not involve tangible sound and is therefore not the same music that other texts have been discussing, it is nonetheless music of some sort:

> 夫明白於天地之德者此之謂大本大宗與天和者也所以均調天下與人和者也與人和者謂之人樂與天和者謂之天樂
> He who has a clear understanding of the Virtue of Heaven and Earth may be called the Great Source, the Great Ancestor. He harmonizes with Heaven; and by doing so he brings equitable accord to the world and harmonizes with men as well. To harmonize with men is called [making] human music; to harmonize with Heaven is called [making] Heavenly Music…This is what is called Heavenly Music.[133]

One will recall how in the "Inner Chapters," Zhuangzi spoke of the Heavenly Pipes and how the operations of the cosmos were fundamentally harmonious. Here, the author uses music to describe an idealized relationship between the sage and Heaven.

In essence, this claim underscores the importance of self-cultivation in accordance with the cosmos, but it also points to music as the expressive arena for such achievement. Achievement in cultivation is described as a harmony attained between an individual and the cosmos. While it can be argued that in this passage music is merely a metaphor for the attainment of the Way, one nevertheless cannot overlook the fact that the author invokes music to beautify, praise, and/or give cosmic legitimacy to what is primarily a mental achievement. In this sense, this passage resonates well with the claim in the "Yueji" and *Lüshi chunqiu* that cultivating the heart-mind is tantamount to achieving a sense of cosmic harmony.

The *Zhuangzi* also adopts the idea that cosmic music is the sage's vehicle for achieving social order. In the passage above, the author goes on to assert: "Heavenly Music is the heart-mind of the sage which is used to rear all under Heaven." 天樂者聖人之心以畜天下也.[134] Here, it becomes clear that through the sage's heart-mind—a heart-mind that is in tune with the music of the cosmos—the benefits

---

[133] Zhuangzi 13 ("Tiandao" 天道), p. 458. Translation adapted from *Basic Writings of Chuang Tzu*, trans. Burton Watson (New York: Columbia University Press, 1996), p. 133. While "Heavenly Music" can also be translated as "Heavenly Joy," I believe that because of the direct reference to harmony and the allusion to the "piping of Heaven" in the "Inner Chapters," it makes sense to interpret this passage as referring more directly to music than to joy.

[134] *Zhuangzi* 13 ("Tian Dao"), p. 463. For my reasons for not translating this phrase as "Heavenly Joy," see the previous note.

of the Way can be reaped on earth. The particular harmony that the sage achieves with the cosmos allows for the nourishment and continued vitality of everything in the world. In keeping with the imperial focus of the previous texts examined, "Heavenly Music" is more than just a metaphor for individual cultivation and achievement of the Way. It is a psychological state achieved by the sage to bring order and harmony to the entire natural and social worlds.

## Conclusion

Over the course of a few centuries, authors extended the concept of harmony so that it referred to a pre-existing reality of the cosmos rather than merely to an ideal of human achievement. Through a brief comparison of texts dating from ca. 450-300 B.C. with texts dating from ca. 300-150 B.C., I have pointed to a linguistic transformation in the use of the term for harmony that also implicates changes in conceptions of music. This change serves as the basis for my narrative concerning the integration of music with both the cosmos and the human psyche in late Warring States and early Han China.

In the musical apologetics of texts such as the newly excavated "Xing zi ming chu" and Xunzi's "Discourse on Music," authors emphasize the role of music in self-cultivation and, in particular, the development of the human psyche. I refer to such discourses on music in terms of a "psychology of influence," as their authors pay close attention to the various aspects of the psyche, such as our emotions and *qi*, that are affected by music. Their psychology draws relationships between music and the human psyche in terms of a mechanics of sound transmission that has profound impact on who we can become and, in the case of Xunzi's writings, on mass psychology and social order. But it does not go so far as to claim that music plays a role in cosmic order or in a human's psychological relationship with the cosmos.

In texts dating from the third century B.C. and on into the early imperial period, authors do not entirely abandon the view that music plays a key role in our psychological development as human beings. However, another perspective now assumes predominance. This perspective stresses what I call a "psychology of cosmic attunement," or, an understanding that underscores the potential of the human psyche to apprehend and experience the fundamental harmony,

or music, of the cosmos. This perspective goes hand-in-hand with the belief that music might fulfill and enhance cosmic operations by tapping into or reverberating with the harmony intrinsic to the cosmos. Given this latter belief, it is in man's best interest to create and perform only those types of music that have the power to effect cosmic harmony and, essentially, large-scale natural order. But in order to create and perform such music, humans must first have a means of understanding the basic harmonies of the cosmos. Texts such as the "Yueji," of the *Liji*, the "Music Chapters" of the *Lüshi chunqiu*, and the "Heaven Chapters" of *Zhuangzi* all posit that the sage or sage-ruler successfully attunes himself to the harmonies of the cosmos so as to bring about social and cosmic order. By fine-tuning his psychology in such a manner, he is further able to apprehend the significance of either the music of the cosmos itself (in the case of the *Zhuangzi*) or human music that enhances cosmic functions (in the "Yueji" and *Lüshi chunqiu*), depending on the specific claims of each text.

The new emphasis on one's psychic apprehension of cosmic music makes sense in the context of a belief that music and musical harmony inheres in the cosmos. But how might one explain the reasons for this new focus on cosmic music and one's attunement to it? One possible response involves understanding these changes in terms of large-scale transformations in religious and cosmological outlooks. The introduction of cosmologies of mystical resonance (the so-called "correlative cosmologies") no doubt informed the way people viewed human relationships to music and the cosmos. According to notions of mystical resonance, the workings of the cosmos are intimately linked to various phenomena in the world, including the human body and music. Everything and every phenomenon is linked in an intricate yet systematic web of mystical, cosmic relations. Thus, the introduction of a new religious outlook that stressed cosmological connections between music and the psyche offers a powerful explanation of the changes we have observed in this essay.

The emergent focus on cosmic music and one's idealized attunement to it can also be explained according to the political changes of the day. Since the later writings on music are likely to have been compiled for the benefit and use of the centralized state, and not just individual aspirants in the Confucian tradition, it seems appropriate that such writings would demonstrate an interest in the authenticity of music. After all, if music were to be of any use in helping maintain

a sense of unity and imperial power, as these texts clearly state that it should, then it would need to be the right kind of music. That is, music would need to help justify state power on a cosmic scale, in keeping with the claims concerning state access to and control over the cosmos that were prevalent in early imperial times. Thus, we might conclude that the notion that music must be authenticated through one's psychic attunement to the cosmos emerged to set a standard for judging and sanctioning certain music specialists and their types of music.[135] According to this claim, the change in musical apologetics from a "psychology of influence" to a "psychology of cosmic attunement" likely reflects how authors, with state interests in mind, tried to justify the importance of music in imperial control, and not merely in self-cultivation. That their justifications invoked the significant effects of music on cosmic order, and not just the self, was part and parcel of an imperative to proclaim the imperial state's privileged access to resources—both psychic and musical—of cosmic control.

[135] The same can be said about musical theories presented in the *Guoyu* 國語, as demonstrated in Schaberg, *A Patterned Past*, pp. 112-120. The perfection of music, as portrayed in that text, also helps fulfill cosmic processes and bring about the psychological contentment (joy) of the people. Schaberg, *A Patterned Past*, p. 115. Such desirable ends require that music be nourished and promoted by only the most expert people in society.